

#### 22 Menachem Av 5772 August 10, 2012



**Brachos Daf 9** 



Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

#### Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o"h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

#### Reading Shema Twice in the Day

The *Mishna* had stated: Rabban Gamliel says: [*Kerias shema in the evening can be recited*] until the light of dawn rises. Rav Yehudah says in the name of Shmuel: The *halachah* follows the view of Rabban Gamliel.

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa*: Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai says: Sometimes a man may recite the *Shema* twice in the night, once before the light of dawn rises and once afterwards, and thereby fulfills his obligation (*of reciting the Shema*) once for the day and once for the night.

The *Gemora* asks: Now this is self-contradictory. You say: A man may recite the *Shema* twice in the night, which indicates that it is still night after the light of dawn rises, and then you say: He thereby fulfills his obligation (of reciting the Shema) once for the day and once for the night, which shows that it is daytime!?

The *Gemora* answers: No! It is (*until sunrise*) in actuality night, but he calls it day because some people rise at that time (*and it is for that reason that he fulfills the mitzvah of reciting shema in the morning, for the verse 'u'v'kumechah' teaches us that one may recite the morning shema as soon as people begin to arise – even though it is night).* 

Rav Acha bar Chanina said in the name of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi: The *halachah* is as stated by Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai.

Some learn Rav Acha bar Chanina's statement on another *braisa*, in which Rabbi Shimon ben Yochai quotes Rabbi Akiva saying that one can recite *Shema* twice during daytime, once before sunrise, for the nighttime *mitzvah*, and once after sunrise, for the daytime *mitzvah*.

The *Gemora* explains that both before and after sunrise is technically considered daytime, but one still fulfills the *mitzvah* of the nighttime reading before sunrise since some people still sleep then.

Rav Acha bar Chanina quotes Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi saying that we rule like Rabbi Shimon in the name of Rabbi Akiva.

Rabbi Zeira says that one who recites *Shema* before sunrise may not say the *brachah* of *hashkiveinu* – lay us down to sleep, since people do not lay down to sleep at this time.

When Rav Yitzchak bar Yosef came from *Eretz Yisroel*, he said that this ruling of Rav Acha was not explicit, but was inferred from a story. Two students got drunk at the wedding of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi's son, and hadn't recited *Shema* until after dawn. When they asked Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi if they can read it then, he said that one can rely on Rabbi Shimon when necessary. (8b - 9a)

# The Sages' Opinion

The *Gemora* discusses the story in the *Mishna* of Rabban Gamliel's sons, who returned from a wedding and asked their father whether they can still recite *Shema* after midnight. The *Gemora* explains that they knew their father's position - that one may recite it the whole night. They were asking, whether the Sages, who say that one has only until midnight, truly dispute Rabban Gamliel, or agree with him in principle, but say that one should recite it before midnight, to avoid someone missing the *mitzvah* altogether. He told them that the Sages agree with him in principle, so they are still obligated in *Shema*.

The *Gemora* explains that the conclusion of the *Mishna*, which lists other examples of *mitzvos* that last until dawn, is Rabban Gamliel continuing to tell them that just as the Sages here say that one





......



should recite before midnight, although the full time is until dawn, so do they say this about the other ones. (9a)

#### Time for Eating Pesach

The *Gemora* notes that the list in the *Mishna* doesn't include eating the Pesach sacrifice, and challenges this from a *braisa*, which says that reciting *Shema* at night, Hallel on Pesach night, and eating the Pesach sacrifice, are all *mitzvos* which one may do until dawn.

The *Gemora* resolves this by saying that the *Mishna* follows Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah, who says that the time of eating the Pesach is only until midnight, while the *braisa* follows Rabbi Akiva, who says that one may eat it until dawn.

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa* explaining this dispute. Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah says that the verse which says that they must eat the meat *balayla hazeh – on this night*, teaches that one must eat it until midnight, as we learn it from the verse in which Hashem says that "I will pass through Egypt balayla hazeh – on this night, and kill the first born," which occurred at midnight. Rabbi Akiva says that the verse which mandates that they eat the Pesach bechipazon – in a rush implies that they eat it until the time of rushing, i.e., the morning in which they rushed out of Egypt.

The *Gemora* explains that Rabbi Akiva says that the verse that says that they must eat it on this night teaches that they may only begin eating it at night, as opposed to other sacrifices, which may be eaten on the same day it is offered.

The *Gemora* asks why the verse had to say *this* night. According to Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah, we understand this was necessary to connect it to the verse about the plague, which used the same phrase, but according to Rabbi Akiva why is it necessary?

The *Gemora* answers that without this word, we may have thought that one may eat the Pesach on the following night as well, similar to a *shelamim*, which is eaten on the day it is offered and the next day. Rabbi Elozar says that we already know this from the verse which says that they may not leave the meat over until the morning, but Rabbi Akiva says that we may have thought that it refers only to the second morning. Rabbi Elozar says that when the verse refers to "the morning," it always refers to the first morning.

The *Gemora* says that this dispute corresponds to another one in a *braisa*. The verse about sacrificing the Pesach says it must be:

1. In the evening (i.e., afternoon)

- 2. When the sun sets (i.e. at night)
- 3. The time when you left Egypt (i.e., in the morning)

Rabbi Eliezer explains that these time periods respectively correspond to:

- 1. Offering it
- 2. Eating it
- 3. Burning the remainder

Rabbi Yehoshua explains that they correspond to:

- 1. Offering it
- 2. Beginning to eat it
- 3. Ending to eat it (by the morning)

Rabbi Abba says that all agree that the actual redemption occurred at night, as the verse says that "Hashem took you out of Egypt at night," and they actually left in the morning, as the verse says that "on the day after the Pesach sacrifice, Bnai Yisrael left Egypt." Their dispute is what the chipazon – rushing in the verse refers to. Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah says that it refers to the Egyptians rushing the Jews out, which occurred at night, while Rabbi Akiva says it refers to the rushing of the Jews out of Egypt, which occurred in the morning.

The *Gemora* supports this timeline from a *braisa* which resolves the seeming contradiction between the two verses by saying that the redemption started at night, but they only left in the morning. (9a)

## Verses about the Exodus, and others

The *Gemora* explains the verse in which Hashem tells Moshe *daber* na - please speak to the nation, telling them to ask the Egyptians for riches to take along. Hashem asked Moshe to please ask the nation to do this, in order to assuage Avraham, lest he complain that Hashem fulfilled the promise of the Jews being enslaved, but not the promise of their leaving with lots of property. *Bnei Yisroel* replied that they would be just as happy leaving with nothing, just as a prisoner would prefer to leave today with nothing rather than wait until tomorrow to leave with riches.

The *Gemora* explains the following verse, which says that Hashem made the Egyptians like *Bnei Yisroel*, vayashilum – and they lent them riches.

Rabbi Ami says that this word teaches that they gave them the riches against their will. Some explain this as against the Egyptians'







9

will, while some explain it as against *Bnei Yisroel's* will, to avoid carrying a heavy burden.

The *Gemora* explains the following verse about *Bnei Yisroel*, which says that *vayinatzlu es Mitzrayim – and they salvaged Egypt*. Rabbi Ami says that this means they emptied Egypt like a *metzudah –* bird trap without grain, while Rish Lakish says it means they emptied it like *metzulah –* the depths with no fish.

The *Gemora* explains the verse in which Hashem tells Moshe that His name is *Ekyeh asher Ekyeh – I will be that I will be*. Hashem was telling Moshe that he should tell *Bnei Yisroel* that He will be with them through this enslavement just as He will be with them through future enslavements. When Moshe said that they have enough suffering now, without mentioning future ones, Hashem said that he should only tell them that *Ekyeh – I will be* sent him, i.e., that He will be with them through this enslavement.

The *Gemora* explains the verse in which Eliyahu at Mount Carmel asks Hashem *anaini Hashem anaini* – *answer me*, *Hashem, answer me*. Rabbi Avahu says that he had two requests: that the fire come down, and that the Jews not be skeptical that Eliyahu was using sorcery. (9a-9b)

#### **Morning Shema Time**

The *Mishna* says that one may begin reciting *Shema* in the morning from the time when one can distinguish between blue and white, while Rabbi Eliezer says it is from the time when one can distinguish between blue and green. It may be recited until sunrise, while Rabbi Yehoshua says it may be recited until three hours in the day, as that is when princes arise. If one recites after that, he is no worse off than anyone else reciting Torah.

The *Gemora* says that it is very easy to distinguish between a piece of white wool and a piece of blue wool, even at night. The *Mishna* is referring to being able to distinguish between white and blue sections of partially dyed wool, which needs more light.

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa* about the starting time for the morning *Shema*. Rabbi Meir says that it is when one can distinguish between a dog and a wolf. Rabbi Akiva says it is when one can distinguish between a donkey and a wild donkey. Others say that it is when can recognize his friend from a distance of four *amos* - cubits.

Rav Huna says we rule like the Others. Abaye says that for putting on *tefillin*, we rule like the Others, but for reciting *Shema*, we rule like the *Vasikin*, who would recite it along with sunrise.

The *Gemora* cites a supporting *braisa*, which says that the *Vasikin* would recite *Shema* with sunrise, in order to lead into Shemoneh Esrai, starting it when the day starts. Rabbi Zaira says that this is based on the verse which says that they will fear you along with the sun. (9b)

### Redemption and Shemoneh Esrei

Rabbi Yosi ben Elyakim testified in the name of the holy congregation of Yerushalayim that anyone who juxtaposes his *Shemoneh Esrei* to the blessing of redemption will not be harmed that whole day.

Rabbi Zeira challenged this, as he did this, but still was harmed. Rabbi Yosi asked him what the harm was, and he said that he had to bring myrtle to the king. Rabbi Yosi told him that that isn't harm, but rather payment for the privilege of seeing a king, as Rabbi Yochanan says that a person should always run to see a Jewish king, and even a non-Jewish one, as he may merit understanding the difference between the different types of royalty.

Rabbi Il'am told Ulla that when he goes to *Eretz Yisroel* he should go to greet his brother Rav Brona in front of all the Sages, as he is a great man, who loves *mitzvos*. Once he was able to juxtapose his *Shemoneh Esrei* to the blessing of redemption, and he didn't stop smiling the whole day.

The *Gemora* asks how someone can do this, as Rabbi Yochanan says that one must introduce *Shemoneh Esrei* with the verse asking Hashem to open our mouths, and conclude it with the verse asking Hashem to accept our words and thoughts.

Rabbi Elozar answers Rabbi Yochanan is only discussing the *Ma'ariv* prayer, since one must only juxtapose the two at *Shacharis*.

The *Gemora* rejects this, as Rabbi Yochanan says that one merits the world to come by juxtaposing the two at *Ma'ariv*.

Rabbi Elozar instead answers that Rabbi Yochanan's statement about the introduction only applies at *Minchah*.









Rav Ashi maintains that his statement is about all the prayers, but since the Sages instituted this verse, it is considered an extension of *Shemoneh Esrei*.

Rav Ashi says we must say this, since otherwise we cannot explain how we say the blessing of *hashkiveinu*, as it interrupts between the blessing of redemption and *Shemoneh Esrei*. We must say that this blessing is an extension of the blessing of redemption, so we can also say that the verse is an extension of *Shemoneh Esrei*.

The *Gemora* notes that the verse said after *Shemoneh Esrei*, "may my words and the thoughts of my heart be pleasant before you," can apply to something one already said, or to something he will say. If so, why did the Sages institute this after *Shemoneh Esrei* and not before?

Rabbi Yehudah the son of Rabbi Shimon ben Pazi answers that since Dovid placed this verse at the end of eighteen chapters of Tehillim, the Sages placed it after the eighteen blessing of *Shemoneh Esrei*. Although there are technically nineteen chapters before it, the *Gemora* explains that the first chapters are considered one, just as the *Halelukah* at the end of chapter 104 is considered to be after 103 chapters.

Rav Shmuel bar Nachmeini quotes Rabbi Yochanan explaining that every chapter that Dovid liked he started and finished with *Ashrei* – *fortunate*. Chapter one starts with Ashrei, and the next Ashrei is at the conclusion of chapter two, making them equivalent to one chapter. (9b - 10a)

## INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

#### Hashkivenu

Rabbi Zeira, when discussing one who recites *Shema* twice in close succession, says that although technically he is reciting one *Shema* during sleeping time, he may not say *hashkiveinu*, since most people are not *going* to sleep then.

Rashi learns that Rabbi Zeira is referring to the case of one who recites the evening *Shema* right before dawn.

Tosfos (9a ubilvad) challenges this, as this is a time when people sleep, and this case was mentioned much earlier.

Tosfos therefore quotes the Sar Mikotzi who says that Rabbi Zeira is referring to the case of one who recites the evening *Shema* after

dawn, but before sunrise, a time at which most people are not sleeping, and which is technically day.

The R"i Gai'as maintains that one must still say two blessings after *Shema*, but he simply omits the initial phrase of the last blessing, which discusses Hashem laying us down to bed.

The Rosh (9) challenges this, as the *Gemora* should have then detailed how to say this blessing, as it does later when discussing the third paragraph of *Shema* at night.

The Rosh therefore rules that one should omit the last blessing entirely in this case.

#### **Morning Shema Time**

The *Mishna* and *Gemora* discuss the starting time for the morning *Shema*. Rav Huna says that we rule like the Others - that the start time is when one can recognize his acquaintance at a distance of four amos.

Tosfos (9b Acherim) cites the Yerushalmi, which says that this refers to one who a somewhat familiar acquaintance. If one is close with this person, he would recognize him from far away, and if he doesn't know him, he wouldn't recognize him at all.

Abaye says that for the start time of *tefillin*, we rule like the others, but for *Shema*, we rule like the *Vasikin*, who would finish *Shema* at sunrise, to follow the blessing of redemption with *Shemoneh Esrei*.

The Rishonim note that there are other *Gemoras* which indicate different time frames for the morning *Shema*. The *Gemora* (8b) cited Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai, who said that one can fulfill the *mitzvah* of reciting the morning *Shema* before sunrise, after dawn, as some people rise at that time. Tosfos (9b likrias *Shema*) also cites the *Gemora* in Yoma, which states that Queen Hilni made a gold plate which reflected the rising sun, alerting people to the right time for *Shema*. Finally, the *Gemora* (10b) also rules like Rabbi Yehoshua, that one may recite *Shema* until three hours.

Tosfos says that the optimal time for *Shema* is like the *Vasikin*. However, most people cannot accomplish this, and they therefore would use Hilni's plate to know when they can recite *Shema*, albeit after sunrise. Technically, one can recite it any time after dawn until three hours.





9

Rabbeinu Tam maintains that we rule, based on the *Gemora* in Yoma, that the correct time for reciting the morning *Shema* is *after* sunrise, not like the *Vasikin*.

Rabbeinu Chananel says that the *Vasikin* wouldn't finish *Shema* at sunrise, but rather *recite* it at sunrise (as the word *gomer – finish* can also mean to recite). This would be consistent with Hilni's plate signal.

The Rosh and Rif say that Abaye agrees that we rule like the others, and therefore the start time for *Shema* is when one recognizes his friend. However, Abaye is stating that the optimal time is right before sunrise. For the masses, who cannot recite it exactly then, Hilni made her plate.

#### Redemption and Shemoneh Esrei

The *Gemora* extols one who follows the blessing of redemption with *Shemoneh Esrei*, and tells the story of Rav Brona, who did so one day, and smiled the whole day as a result.

Tosfos (9b kol) explains that the *Gemora* is referring to not just following this order, but doing it exactly at sunrise. It was this accomplishment that led Rav Brona to his happiness. When one cannot avoid it, he may recite *Shema* starting from dawn, as the *Gemora* stated earlier.

# Whose Opinion Does the Shulchan Aruch Follow?

In the preface to his Haggadah, the Kesav Sofer asks that the Shulchan Aruch seems to contradict himself. In Orach Chaim (477:1), the Shulchan Aruch rules that one should be careful to eat the *afikomen* before *chatzos*. This indicates that he rules like the opinion of Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah. However, later (481:2) he rules that a person is obligated to relate the story of going out of Egypt until "sleep grabs him." This indicates that there is an obligation the whole night to discuss going out of Egypt. The reason this implies he follows Rabbi Akiva's opinion is that there is only an obligation to relate the story of going out of Egypt "when *matzah* and *marror* is placed before you," meaning during a time when there is an obligation to eat *matzah*. It must be that the Shulchan Aruch holds there is still an obligation to eat *matzah* the whole night, as per the opinion of Rabbi Akiva! How can we reconcile this seeming contradiction?

The Kesav Sofer answers that the Shulchan Aruch is stringent according to both the opinion of Rabbi Elozar ben Azaryah and Rabbi Akiva. Accordingly, he says one should make sure to eat *matzah* before *chatzos*. However, he also rules that one must continue to relate the story of going out of Egypt the entire night, as per the opinion of Rabbi Akiva.

# **DAILY MASHAL**

Rabbi Nachum from Chernobyl was once staying at a Jewish owned inn. At midnight, Reb Nachum recited Tikkun Chatzos with such emotion and tears that he awakened the innkeeper's family. The innkeeper rushed to Reb Nachum, asking if there was anything wrong. Reb Nachum responded, "Nothing hurts me except that the Beis HaMikdash is destroyed, and I am lamenting the destruction and the exile." The innkeeper wondered aloud, "What is this destruction and this exile that you are referring to?" Reb Nachum was amazed at the man's ignorance. "Do you not know? We once had a Beis HaMikdash and it was destroyed. We were once residing in Eretz Yisroel and were exiled from the Land. I am now beseeching Hashem that He should send us Mashiach to take us out of exile, and bring us to Eretz Yisroel. Are you prepared to go up to Eretz Yisroel?" The innkeeper responded, "Let me ask my wife. Who knows if it is really worthwhile to go to Eretz Yisroel?" He went to ask his wife, and immediately returned with an unequivocal response, "We will not be going up to Eretz Yisroel! How can we follow Mashiach and leave all our livestock here?" Reb Nachum did not give up so easily. "Is it so good here? The Cossacks are always inciting pogroms and murdering and plundering everything." The innkeeper did not know how to respond, so he went back to his wife, the "genius" with all the answers to his dilemmas. She told her husband, "Tell the Rebbe that he should pray to Hashem that He should immediately send the Cossacks to Eretz Yisroel and then we will be able to remain here in peace with all of our livestock."

By no longer tolerating the exile, we can begin to attain freedom. Becoming accustomed to living amongst the gentiles is what lengthens the days of the exile. Therefore, Hashem promised us that I shall take you out from under the burdens of Egypt, and subsequently I shall rescue you from their service.



