

12 Teves 5782
Dec. 16, 2021



Megillah Daf 4

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

And Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: Lod, Ono and Gei Hecharashim were cities that have been surrounded by walls from the time of Yehoshua. - But did Yehoshua build these? Was it not Elpeal who built them, as it is written: And the sons of Elpeal; Ever and Misham and Shemed, who built Ono and Lod, with its towns? — But according to your reasoning, Asa built them, as it is written: And he built fenced cities in Judah? — Rather, Rabbi Elozar explains that these cities were surrounded by walls in the times of Yehoshua. They were subsequently destroyed during the *Pilegesh b’Givah* incident. Elpeal rebuilt them. They again fell and Asa came and rebuilt them. There is an indication of this in the text also, as it is written: For he said to Judah: Let us build these cities. From this we can infer that they had already been towns beforehand; and this may be taken as proved. (3b - 4a)

And Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: It is obligatory for women to hear the reading of the Megillah, because they benefited also by the same miracle (*Haman’s decree to kill all the Jewish people included the women*). (4a)

And Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: If Purim falls on a Shabbos (and thereby the Megillah is read earlier), there is nevertheless an obligation to publicly lecture (on Shabbos about Purim).

The Gemora asks: Isn’t this true regarding all the festivals? Wasn’t it taught in a Baraisa: Moshe ordained that we should publicly lecture on the duties of each day? We must lecture on the halachos of Pesach on Pesach, the halachos of Shavuos on Shavuos and the halachos of Sukkos on Sukkos.

The Gemora answers that it was necessary to teach this halachah regarding Purim since one might have thought that

on Shabbos, the public lectures pertaining to Purim should be prohibited on the account of Rabbah’s decree (Rabbah decreed that the Megillah should not be read on Shabbos since one might carry it four amos in a public domain). Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi teaches us that such a precautionary measure is not taken regarding the public lecture. (4a)

And Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: One is obligated to read the Megillah on the night of Purim and repeat it on the day of Purim, as it is said: My God, I cry in the daytime, but You do not answer me, and in the night season and I am not silent. The students took this to mean that the [Megillah] should be read at night, and the Mishnah relating to it should be learned in the morning. Rabbi Yirmiyah, however, said to them: It has been explained to me by Rabbi Chiya bar Abba [that the word ‘repeat’ here has the same meaning] as when, for instance, men say, I will go through this section and repeat it. It was also stated by Rabbi Chelbo in the name of Ulla from Biri: One is obligated to read the Megillah on the night of Purim and repeat it on the day of Purim, as it is said: So that my soul might sing (about the miracle of Purim) to You (referring to the day) and not be stilled (by night), Hashem my God, forever will I thank You. (4a)

The Mishnah had stated that the Megillah is read on the fourteenth of Adar but the villagers may advance to the day of the gathering.

Rabbi Chanina said: The sages were lenient for the inhabitants of villages to read on the days of gathering, so that they will be available on the fourteenth to supply water and food for their brothers who live in the large towns. It emerges according to Rabbi Chanina; this leniency was enacted for the benefit of the people residing in the large



towns. If so, the Gemora asks, why does our Mishnah state that if the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Monday, villages and large towns read on that day; according to Rabbi Chanina, the villagers should advance their reading to the Thursday before? The Gemora answers that the Thursday before would be the tenth of Adar and that is not a possible date to read the Megillah.

The Gemora asks on Rabbi Chanina from a different case in our Mishnah. The Mishnah rules that if the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Thursday, villages and large towns read on that day; according to Rabbi Chanina, the villagers should advance their reading to the Monday before, which is the eleventh of Adar (and a possible day to read the Megillah)? The Gemora answers that the sages did not move the reading of the Megillah from one day of gathering to another.

The Gemora asks on Rabbi Chanina from a Mishnah below (5a). Rabbi Yehudah states that the ordinance (*of reading the Megillah early*) was only in those places where the people from the villages came to the towns on Mondays and Thursdays; but in the places where they do not enter the towns, the Megillah is only read in its main time. If the reason for the leniency was for the benefit of the townspeople, why would the fact that the villagers don't enter the towns prevent us from helping the townspeople? [This is a successful challenge to our initial understanding of Rabbi Chanina.] The Gemora clarifies Rabbi Chanina's viewpoint: The sages were lenient for the inhabitants of villages to read on the days of gathering because they supply water and food for their brothers who live in the large towns and this way, they would not be compelled to make another trip into the city on the fourteenth. (4a – 4b)

The Mishnah had stated that if the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Monday, villages and the large towns read on that day, etc.

¹ It is impracticable for towns to retain this date and also to read before the walled cities.

The Gemora asks: Why does the former part of the Mishnah follow the order of the days of the month, and the latter part of the Mishnah follows the order of the days of the week? The Gemora answers: If the latter part of the Mishnah were to follow the order of the days of the month, the days of the week would be in the reverse order; therefore, the Tanna follows the order of the days of the week. (4b)

The Mishnah had stated that if the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Friday, villages advance to the day of gathering, and the large towns and those surrounded by a wall read on that day. – Whose opinion is the Mishnah following? It can be following the opinion of Rebbe or the opinion of Rabbi Yosi.

Which opinion of Rebbe are we referencing? It was taught in a Baraisa: If the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Friday, villages and the large towns advance to the day of gathering, and those surrounded by a wall read on that day. Rebbe said: I say that the large towns are not moved from their regular spot, but rather, both of them (the large towns and those surrounded by a wall) read on that day (Friday, the fourteenth).

What is the reason of the Tanna Kamma? It is written [Esther 9:27]: *in each and every year*. Just as every year large towns precede walled cities in the reading of the Megillah, so too in this case, the large towns must precede the walled cities (and since the walled cities must read on Friday, the fourteenth, the large towns advance to Thursday). - But why not argue thus: 'In each and every year': just as every year towns are not required to shift their date, so here towns should not be required to shift their date? — There is a special reason [for not reasoning thus here] since this is impracticable.¹

And what is Rebbe's reason? It is written: *in each and every year*. Just as every year the large towns do not move from their regular spot, so too in this case, the large towns read on Friday. - But why not reason thus: 'In each and every year': just as in most years, towns read before walled cities, so here

towns should read before walled cities? — There is a special reason [for not arguing thus here], because this is impracticable.²

Which opinion of Rabbi Yosi are we referencing? It was taught in a Baraisa: If the fourteenth of Adar falls on a Friday, cities that are surrounded by a wall and villages advance to the day of gathering, and the large towns read on that day. Rabbi Yosi said: The walled cities can never precede the large towns, rather, the large towns and those surrounded by a wall read on Friday, the fourteenth.

What is the reason of the Tanna Kamma? It is written: *in each and every year*. Just as every year, the large towns read on the fourteenth, and the large towns and cities surrounded by a wall read on two different days, so too in this case, the large towns read on that day (and they do not advance to the thirteenth), and the large towns and cities surrounded by a wall read on two different days (so the walled cities advance to the day of gathering). - But why not reason thus: 'In each and every year': Just as in most years walled cities do not read before towns, so here walled cities should not read before towns? — Here the case is different, because it cannot be avoided.

And what is Rabbi Yosi's reason? It is written: *in each and every year*. Just as every year the walled cities do not precede the large towns, so too in this case, the walled cities cannot precede the large towns (and they both read on Friday). - But why not reason thus: 'In each and every year': Just as in most years the time of one is not the same as the time of the other, so here the time of one should not be the same as the time of the other? — Here the case is different, because it cannot be avoided. [It emerges that the Tanna of our Mishnah can follow either Rebbe's opinion or that of Rabbi Yosi.]

The Gemora asks: And does Rebbe really hold that the unwalled cities do not move to the day of gathering; yet it was taught in a different Baraisa: If the fourteenth of Adar falls on Shabbos, the villages advance and read on the day of

gathering (the twelfth of Adar), the large towns advance and read on Friday (the thirteenth) and the walled cities read on Sunday, the fifteenth. Rebbe said, I said: Once the large towns move from their regular spot, they move to the day of gathering (the twelfth). The Gemora answers that the reason the large towns are moved to the day of the gathering is only because they are not reading on their regular day anyway; in such a case we move them to the day of the gathering. In the former case, where the fourteenth falls out on Friday, there is no reason to advance the large towns to the day of the gathering.

Whose authority is followed in this ruling enunciated by Rabbi Chelbo in the name of Rav Huna: If Purim falls on Shabbos, all shift the reading to the day of the gathering? 'All shift their reading', do you say? [How can this be] seeing that we have the walled cities which read on the Sunday? — What we should say is, 'All who are shifted are shifted to the day of the gathering'. Which authority, [you ask]? — Rebbe. (4b) All the Tannaim agree that the Megillah must not be read on Shabbos. What is the reason for this? Rabbah explains: Since everyone is obligated to read the Megillah, but not all are able to read it; the Rabbis issued a decree not to read the Megillah on Shabbos as a precautionary measure, lest one take the Megillah in his hand and go with it to an expert to learn to read it, and at the same time he will carry four amos in a public domain. This is the same reason why we do not blow the shofar on Rosh Hashanah when it falls on Shabbos, and we do not shake the lulav on Sukkos when it falls on Shabbos.

Rav Yosef offered another reason: It is because the poor anxiously wait for the day when the Megillah is read to receive gifts which are usually allocated when the Megillah is read. [Since the money cannot be distributed to the poor on Shabbos, they moved the reading of the Megillah to a different day.] It has been taught in a Baraisa to the same effect: Although it has been laid down that villages advance the reading forward to the day of the gathering,

² It is impracticable for the towns to read before the walled cities and yet not shift their date.

contributions are collected and distributed on the same day. 'Although it has been laid down'! On the contrary, it is because it has been laid down! — Read therefore: Since it has been laid down that villages advance the reading forward to the day of the gathering, contributions are collected and distributed on the same day, because the poor are waiting anxiously for the reading of the Megillah, but rejoicing is kept only at the proper season. (4b – 5a)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

THE OBLIGATION OF WOMEN TO READ THE MEGILLAH

Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi ruled: It is obligatory for women to hear the reading of the Megillah, because they benefited also by the same miracle (*Haman's decree to kill all the Jewish people included the women*).

The Rishonim dispute whether a woman can read the Megillah and discharge the obligation for a man. Rashi (Eruchin 3a) maintains that she could and Tosfos cites a Behag that she cannot. There are those that explain the Behag that he holds that a woman is only obligated to *hear* the Megillah but not to *read* it. Rashi's viewpoint is easily understood by the fact that the Gemora explicitly states that women are obligated in the *reading* of the Megillah. The Beis Yosef (O"C 689) writes that according to the Behag, the correct version in the Gemora is that women are obligated to hear the Megillah.

Mishnah Berurah (689:13) writes that the reason a woman cannot read the Megillah on behalf of a man is because it is similar to Kerias HaTorah, where a woman is disqualified because of public dignity.

The Eshkol offers a different explanation and states that a woman cannot read the Megillah for a man because of the prohibition of "kol b'isha ervoh."

The Imrei Baruch explains the viewpoint of the Behag why women will only be obligated to hear the Megillah and not to

read it. The Gemora below (14a) states that the prophets offered a kal vachomer argument in creating an obligation to read the Megillah. If the Jews, who were liberated from slavery in Mitzrayim and brought to freedom, sang praises to Hashem when they saw the Egyptians drowning; certainly we should commemorate our deliverance from death to life. That is why we read the Megillah publicly, where we are thanking Hashem for saving us from Haman's decree. There is a distinction, however, between the way the men sang praise and the way the women sang. Moshe recited each phrase and all the male Jews repeated after him. The women did not sing; Miriam said each phrase and they responded with musical instruments, not with singing. According to this, we can say that the same distinction should apply by Megillah. The men, who sang songs of praise by the sea, have an obligation to read the Megillah; the women who only heard the songs of praise have an obligation to hear the Megillah, but not to read it.