

5 Mar-Cheshvan 5773
Oct. 21, 2012



Shabbos Daf 18

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o"n

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Starting Work Before Shabbos

The *Mishna* lists activities done before *Shabbos*, which Beis Shammai restrict and Beis Hillel do not.

Beis Shammai says that:

1. One may not soak ink, herbs, and vetch unless they are fully soaked before *Shabbos*.
2. One may not place bundles of flax in the oven unless they will heat up before *Shabbos*.
3. One may not place wool in a pot of dye unless it will get dyed before *Shabbos*.
4. One may not set a trap for animals, birds, or fish, unless they will be caught before *Shabbos*.
5. One may not sell something to a non-Jew, load his donkey, or help him carry a load, unless he will arrive home before *Shabbos*.
6. One may not give hides to a tanner, nor give clothing to a cleaner, unless they can finish it before *Shabbos*.

In all these cases, Beis Hillel allows everything until the end of the day.

Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel says that his father's household would be sure to give their linen clothing to the cleaner three days before *Shabbos*, to ensure they would finish before *Shabbos*.

All agree that one may place the beam on top of the ground grapes or olives, even though this will squeeze more liquid out on *Shabbos*. (17b – 18a)

Kneading

The *Gemora* asks: Which *Tanna* holds that pouring water into ink constitutes its soaking (which will result in the prohibition of kneading)?

Rav Yosef answered: It is Rebbe, for it was taught in a *braisa*: If one puts in the flour and another puts in the water, the second one is liable (for kneading, for he was the one who caused the two ingredients to bind together); these are the words of Rebbe. Rabbi Yosi the son of Rabbi Yehudah said: He is not liable unless he kneads them (*manually*).

Abaye said to him: Yet perhaps Rabbi Yosi ruled like that only in respect to flour, which is subject to kneading; but as for ink, which is not subject to kneading, I may say that he is liable (even for simply adding the water to the ink)?

The *Gemora* answers: That cannot enter your mind, for it was taught in a *braisa*: If one puts in the ashes and another puts in the water, the second is liable (for kneading, for he was the one who caused the two ingredients to bind together); these are the words of Rebbe. Rabbi Yosi the son of Rabbi Yehudah said: He is not liable unless he kneads them (*manually*). [He states his opinion even though ashes are not subject to kneading.]

The *Gemora* asks: Yet perhaps what is meant by 'eifer' (which usually means ashes) 'afar' (meaning earth), which is subject to kneading?

The *Gemora* answers: But one *braisa* states 'eifer,' and one states 'afar' (indicating that R' Yosi holds his opinion by both cases)!

The *Gemora* answers: Were they then taught together (that you can make such an inference; perhaps they are both referring to earth and not ashes)? [Accordingly, there is no proof that our *Mishna* follows Rebbe, for perhaps R' Yosi agrees by ink.] (18a)



Work Before Shabbos

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa*: One may open a water channel from a spring to a garden immediately prior to Shabbos, although the garden will continue to fill with water throughout Shabbos. [It is forbidden to plant on Shabbos, as this violates the Biblical prohibition called *zorea*. One cannot water plants as well. Here, one may irrigate the garden before Shabbos, even though this will facilitate the growth of vegetation on Shabbos.] One may place burning incense under clothing immediately prior to Shabbos, and the clothing will continue to be perfumed through the incense the entire Shabbos. [It was the custom to burn incense under clothing so the clothing would exude a nice fragrance. Burning incense falls under the Biblical prohibition of *havarah*, burning.] One may place sulfur under silver vessels immediately prior to Shabbos, and they will continue to highlight the designs in the silver the entire Shabbos. [Burning sulfur falls under the Biblical prohibition of *havarah*, burning.] One may place collyrium on an eye and one may place a bandage on a wound immediately prior to Shabbos, and the eye or wound will continue to heal the entire Shabbos. [Administering medicine on Shabbos is forbidden because the *Chachamim* wished to safeguard people from violating the Biblical prohibition of *tochain*, grinding, which was necessary for the preparation of medicine. Regarding the eye salve or bandaging a wound, one could also violate the Biblical prohibition of *memachek*, smoothing. The *braisa* teaches us that one may apply the salve or bandage prior to Shabbos, even though the healing effects will occur on Shabbos.] One may not place wheat into a water mill on Friday unless there is enough time for the wheat to be ground before the onset of Shabbos.

The *Gemora* asks: What is the reason (for this prohibition)?

Rabbah said: it is because it makes a noise. [One is forbidden Rabbinnically from allowing his water mill to operate on Shabbos because it makes noise, and this is not restful towards Shabbos.]

Rav Yosef said to him: Let the Master say it is on account of the resting of utensils, for it was taught in a *braisa*: And regarding all things that I have said to you shall you take heed; this includes the resting of utensils!?

Rather, said Rav Yosef, it is on account of the resting of utensils.

The *Gemora* asks: Now that you say that according to Beis Hillel, the resting of utensils is a Biblical precept, why are the sulfur and incense permitted (in the beginning of the *braisa*)?

The *Gemora* answers: It is because it (the vessel in which they lie) is performing no action (but rather, it is completely passive; this is in contrast to the water mill, which is actively grinding the wheat).

The *Gemora* asks: But why are the bundles of flax permitted? [Beis Hillel, in the *Mishna*, allows one to heat the oven.]

The *Gemora* answers: It is because it (the oven in which they lie) performs no action and is completely passive.

The *Gemora* asks: But what of the trap for the beasts, bird and fish, which performs an action (for the spring of the trap closes and the mesh of the nets tightens as they catch their prey); why are they permitted?

The *Gemora* answers: There too, the *Mishna* is referring to a fish hook and a basket, so that no action is performed.

The *Gemora* notes: Now, however, that Rav Oshaya said in the name of Rav Assi: Which *Tanna* maintains that the resting of utensils is a Biblical precept? It is Beis Shammai, and not Beis Hillel! It emerges as follows: According to Beis Shammai, whether it (the utensil) performs an action or not, it is forbidden, while in the opinion of Beis Hillel, even if it performs an action it is permitted.

The *Gemora* asks: And now that you say that according to Beis Shammai it is forbidden even if it performs no action, if so, why are the incense and the sulfur permitted (in the beginning of the *braisa*)?

The *Gemora* answers: There, it (the incense and the sulfur) lies upon the earth (and not in a utensil).

The *Gemora* asks: But what of a barrel (for brewing beer), a lamp, a pot and a spit; why do Beis Shammai permit them? [Beer brews in its barrel more than eight days, thus including Shabbos. Similarly, the lamp burns during Shabbos, the pot stands on the heated range, causing some shrinkage of its contents, and the spit was allowed to lie in the oven with the Passover sacrifice roasting on Friday night. Thus all these utensils are employed on Shabbos.]

The *Gemora* answers: It is because their ownership is renounced. [Their owner formally renounces his ownership, and then he is under no obligation to ensure that they rest.]

The *Gemora* asks: Who is the *Tanna* who authored the following *braisa*: A woman must not fill a pot with *asasiyos* and *turmesin*



(types of beans which take more than twenty-four hours to cook) and place it in the oven immediately prior to *Shabbos* (in order for it to be ready after *Shabbos*); and if she does put them there, they are forbidden at the conclusion of the *Shabbos* until the time it would have taken to prepare them has elapsed. Similarly, a baker must not fill a barrel of water and place it in the oven immediately prior to *Shabbos*; and if he does, it (the water) is forbidden at the conclusion of the *Shabbos* until the time it would have taken to boil them has elapsed. Shall we say that this agrees with Beis Shammai, not Beis Hillel (since they do not require the utensils to rest on *Shabbos*)?

The *Gemora* answers: You may even say that it is Beis Hillel, for it is a preventive measure, lest he stir the coals.

The *Gemora* asks: If so, let us decree likewise in respect of the incense and the sulfur?

The *Gemora* answers: There, he will not stir them, for if he does, the smoke will enter and harm them.

The *Gemora* asks: Let us decree in respect of the bundles of flax as well?

The *Gemora* answers: There, since a draft is harmful to them, he will not uncover it.

The *Gemora* asks: Let us decree also in respect of wool in the dye vat?

Shmuel answered: This refers to a vat removed (from the fire).

The *Gemora* asks: But let us be concerned that he may stir within it (which will cause it to cook faster, which is regarded as an act of cooking)?

The *Gemora* answers: This refers to a vat removed from (the fire) and sealed (as well).

The *Gemora* notes: And now that the master has said: It is a preventive measure, lest he stir the coals, a pot of raw food may be placed in an oven immediately prior to *Shabbos*. What is the reason? Since it will not be fit for the evening, he diverts his attention from it and he will not come to stir the coals. And if it is cooked, it is allowed as well (for he will not come to stir the coals). If it is partly cooked, it is forbidden. Yet, if raw meat is thrown into it, it is permitted (for he is demonstrating that he has no intention of eating it in the evening).

The *Gemora* notes further: And now that the master has said: Whatever may be harmed by a draft, one will not uncover it, with meat of a kid (which is tender and will be harmed by a draft), and where the oven is sealed (with clay, so he will not be able to stir it so easily), it is permitted (to have the meat roast on *Shabbos*). Meat of a ram, however (which is tough and will not be harmed by a draft), and where the oven is not sealed, it is forbidden. But as to the meat of a kid, where it is not sealed, or of a ram, where it is sealed - Rav Ashi permits it, while Rabbi Yirmiyah of Difti forbids it.

The *Gemora* asks: Now, according to Rav Ashi, who permits it, did we not learn in our *Mishna*: Meat, onions or eggs may not be roasted unless they can be roasted while it is still day?

The *Gemora* answers: There, the reference is to a ram, and where the oven is not sealed.

There were others who stated as follows: With meat of a kid (which is tender and will be harmed by a draft), whether the oven is sealed (with clay, so he will not be able to stir it so easily), or even if it is not sealed, it is permitted (to have the meat roast on *Shabbos*, for the fact that the draft is harmful to it, one will not open the oven to stir the coals). Meat of a ram, (which is tough and will not be harmed by a draft), where the oven is sealed, it is also permitted. They argue by the meat of a ram, where it is not sealed - Rav Ashi permits it, while Rabbi Yirmiyah of Difti forbids it.

The *Gemora* asks: Now, according to Rav Ashi, who permits it, did we not learn in our *Mishna*: Meat, onions or eggs may not be roasted unless they can be roasted while it is still day?

The *Gemora* answers: There, the reference is to meat on the coals (and even Rav Ashi agrees that there is a concern that one might stir it).

Ravina said: As for raw squash, it is permitted (to have it roast on *Shabbos*), since a draft is harmful to it, it is like meat of a kid.

The *Mishna* had stated: Beis Shammai say: We do not sell (to a gentile on Friday etc., but Beis Hillel permits).

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa*: Beis Shammai maintain: A man must not sell his article to a Gentile, nor lend it to him, nor loan him money, nor give him a gift (on the eve of *Shabbos*), unless he can reach his house (before *Shabbos*); while Beis Hillel say: unless he can reach the house nearest the city wall (where he lives). Rabbi Akiva said: Unless he can depart from the door of the Jew's house



(before the *Shabbos*). Rabbi Yosi the son of Rabbi Yehudah said: The words of Rabbi Akiva are the very words of Beis Hillel; Rabbi Akiva comes only to explain the words of Beis Hillel.

The *Gemora* cites a *braisa*: Beis Shammai says: A man must not sell his *chametz* to a Gentile, unless he knows that it will be consumed before Passover; these are the words of Beis Shammai. But Beis Hillel say: As long as the Jew may eat it, he may sell it. Rabbi Yehudah said: Babylonian *kutach* (a dip made of sour milk, the crusts of moldy bread and salt) and any kind of *kutach* may not be sold thirty days before Passover (for it takes a long time to consume). (18a – 19a)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

Acting Stringently

Rabbi Shimon ben Gamliel states that his father's household was accustomed to give white clothing to the gentile launderer three days prior to *Shabbos*. This implies that Rabbi Gamliel's household was stringent like Beis Shammai, who maintains that one cannot give clothing to a gentile launderer before *Shabbos* unless the laundering is completed before the onset of *Shabbos*.

The Bach derives from this ruling that if wishes he can be stringent in *halachah* like Beis Shammai or one can follow the ruling of an individual over a majority.

The Tosfos Yom Tov, however, writes that thus situation was unique that Rabbi Shimon ben Gamliel was stringent like Beis Shammai, as the laundering did not involve being proactive. In other situations, however, Rabbi Shimon ben Gamliel would not have subscribed to the ruling of Beis Shammai.

What is difficult is that in Brachos the *Gemora* records that Rabbi Tarfon recited Shema while he was reclining and he endangered himself. The Chachamim told Rabbi Tarfon that he was liable for his actions, as he had not heeded the opinion of Beis Hillel. From the *Gemora* in Brachos it is implicit that the Chachamim held Rabbi Tarfon to have erred, even though he acted stringently like the opinion of Beis Shammai.

Tosfos in Brachos answers that the case of Shema was unique in that Rabbi Tarfon may have not recited Shema at all, as he had to seek out a place where he could lie down. In other cases, however, one can act stringently.

Using A Time Clock On Shabbos

The *Gemora* records that one may open a water channel from a spring to a garden immediately prior to *Shabbos*, although the garden will continue to fill with water throughout *Shabbos*.

Reb Moshe Feinstein writes in Igros Moshe that an act of labor that is performed on *Shabbos* through a time clock, such as placing food in the oven before *Shabbos* and setting the oven to turn on *Shabbos*, is forbidden. The reason for this prohibition is that the Chachamim only permitted one to place a pot on the fire on Friday, or to open a water channel from a spring to a garden. Those cases are permitted as the person has already completed the action. In a case where the act of labor has not even commenced, however, there is no room for leniency. Although there is no source that states explicitly that setting the time clock is forbidden, one should not do this because it violates the sanctity of *Shabbos*. If such an act was permitted, then people would set time clocks to activate all types of mechanisms on *Shabbos*, and this would be a dishonor to *Shabbos*.

The Chazon Ish slowed for a time clock to be used in milking cows with a machine on *Shabbos*. Nonetheless, that was a unique leniency that involved pain for the animals and a loss for the owner.

Rabbi Yaakov Kamenetsky zt"l ruled that it is forbidden to use a time clock that will cause air conditioning and ovens to go on and off on *Shabbos*, as these devices can be turned on prior to *Shabbos* and remain running the whole *Shabbos*.

Rav Elyashiv, however, permits the setting of time clocks for these devices.