



Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamot of

Moshe Raphael ben Yehoshua (Morris Stadtmauer) o”h
Tzvi Gershon ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

Mav the studing of the Daf Notes be a zechus for their neshamot and mav their souls find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Now, they (all the cases in the Mishnah) are [all] necessary. For if we were told about an eggshell; there the Rabbis say [that it is forbidden] because since it is not loathsome¹ he will come to take supplies from it;² but as for an earthen [shell], which is loathsome,³ I might argue that they agree with Rabbi Yehudah.⁴ While if we were told of an earthen [shell]: [only] there does Rabbi Yehudah rule thus, but in the other case I might say that he agrees with the Rabbis. And if we were told of these two: Rabbi Yehudah rules [thus] of these because nothing interposes;⁵ but as for a dish, which interposes,⁶ I would say that he agrees with the Rabbis. While if we were told of that: [only] there do the Rabbis rule [thus], but in the first two I would say that they agree with Rabbi Yehudah. Thus they are necessary.

The Mishnah had stated: But if the potter joins it beforehand, it is permitted, etc. It was taught: if he joins it with plaster or potter's clay, it is permitted. But we learned, the potter?⁷ - What is meant by potter? After the manner of a potter.

It was taught, Rabbi Yehudah said: We were once spending the Shabbos in the upper chamber of Nithzeh's house in Lud, when an eggshell was brought, which we filled with oil,

perforated, and placed over the mouth of the lamp; and though Rabbi Tarfon and the elders were present, they said nothing to us. They [the Sages] said to him, From there [you adduce] proof? The house of Nithzeh is different, because they were most zealous.⁸

Avin of Sepphoris dragged a bench in a stone-paved upper chamber in the presence of Rabbi Yitzchak ben Elozar, Said he to him, If I let this pass in silence, as his companions kept silent before Rabbi Yehudah, destruction will ensue: a stone-paved chamber is forbidden on account of an ordinary chamber.⁹

The synagogue overseer of Batzrah dragged a bench in front of Rabbi Yirmiyah Rabbah. Said he to him, in accordance with whom? [Presumably] Rabbi Shimon! Assume that Rabbi Shimon ruled [thus] in the case of larger ones, since it is impossible otherwise;¹⁰ did he say thus of small ones? Now, he disagrees with Ulla, who said: They differ [only] in respect of small ones, but as for large, all agree that it is permitted.

Rav Yosef objected: Rabbi Shimon said, A man may drag a couch, chair, or bench, providing that he does not intend making a rut. Thus both large and small [articles] are

¹ The oil in the eggshell is clean.

² On the Shabbos. This is forbidden on account of extinguishing the light. [Though it is not actually extinguished when he removes some oil, it subsequently goes out sooner than it would otherwise have done.]

³ The oil in it becomes soiled and unclean.

⁴ There is no fear that one may draw supplies from it.

⁵ Between the lamp and the shell, which is directly over its mouth: hence Rabbi Yehudah regards it all as one, even when not actually joined.

⁶ Between the lamp and the oil.

⁷ Which implies that it must be professionally done, whereas 'he joins it' denotes an amateur job by the owner.

⁸ And there was no fear of their drawing off oil.

⁹ Which is earth-paved; dragging there is prohibited because it forms a rut.

¹⁰ A large bench, table, etc., cannot be lifted but must be dragged.

taught,¹¹ which is a difficulty on both views. - Ulla reconciles it according to his view, and Rabbi Yirmiyah Rabbah reconciles it according to his. Ulla reconciles it according to his view: the couch is like the chair.¹² While Rabbi Yirmiyah Rabbah reconciles it according to his: the chair is like the couch.¹³

Rabbah objected: Clothes merchants sell in their normal fashion, providing that one does not intend [to gain protection] from the sun in hot weather or from the rain when it is raining;¹⁴ but the strictly religious sling them on a staff behind their back. Now here that it is possible to do as the strictly religious, it is the same as small [articles of furniture], yet when one has no intention Rabbi Shimon permits it at the outset? This refutation of Rabbi Yirmiyah Rabbah is indeed a refutation. (29b)

Mishnah: One who extinguishes a light in Shabbos out of concern for danger is exempt.

If one is afraid of gentiles, bandits, harmful spirits, or desires that a sick person is able to sleep and toward this end he extinguishes a lamp on Shabbos, he is exempt. The reason he is exempt is because the act of labor that he performed is a *melachah sheain tzricha legufa*, an act of labor that does not have a defined purpose.

One who extinguished the wick for a defined purpose is liable a chatas offering.

If one extinguishes the lamp to spare the lamp, the oil, or the wick, although he has not performed a *melachah shetzricha legufa*, an act of labor that has a defined purpose, the *Tanna Kama* (first opinion in the Mishnah) he is still liable a chatas offering. The reason for this is because the *Tanna Kama* follows the ruling of Rabbi Yehudah that one who performed a *melachah sheain tzricha legufa* is liable as if he had performed a true act of labor. Rabbi Yosi, however,

maintains that in all cases one would be exempt, except when he extinguishes the wick in order to make the wick into charcoal. The *Gemora* later (31b) will explain the reason for Rabbi Yosi's ruling. (29b)

Since the second clause teaches, he is liable, it may be inferred that it is Rabbi Yehudah.¹⁵ Then to what does the first clause refer? If to an invalid dangerously ill, [the *Tanna*] should have stated, 'it is permitted'?¹⁶ While if to an invalid who is not in danger, he should have stated, He is liable to a chatas?¹⁷ - After all, [it refers] to an invalid dangerously sick, and logically he should teach, it is permitted; but because he wishes to teach 'he is liable' in the second clause, he also teaches 'he is not liable' in the first. And as for what Rabbi Oshaia taught: If it is for the sake of a sick person, that he should sleep, he must not extinguish it; but if he extinguishes it, he is not liable, though it is forbidden-that refers to one who is not dangerously ill, and agrees with Rabbi Shimon.¹⁸

This question was asked before Rabbi Tanchum of Nevay: What about extinguishing a burning lamp for a sick man on the Shabbos? — Thereupon he commenced and spoke: You, Shlomo, where is your wisdom and where is your understanding? It is not enough for you that your words contradict the words of your father David, but that they are self-contradictory! Dovid HaMelech proclaimed that the dead cannot praise Hashem, and you praised the dead who are better off than the living. You contradicted yourself when you stated that a live dog is better than a dead lion. He resolved the contradictions by stating: As to what Dovid said: 'The dead cannot praise God', this is what he meant: Let a man always engage in Torah and good deeds before he dies, for as soon as he dies he is restrained from [the practice of] Torah and good deeds, and the Holy One, Blessed be He, finds nothing to praise in him. And thus Rabbi Yochanan said, What is meant by the verse, Among the dead [I am] free? Once a man dies, he becomes free of the Torah and good deeds. And as to what

¹¹ A couch is large; a chair is small.

¹² I.e., a small couch is meant.

¹³ A large, heavy chair is meant.

¹⁴ The reference is to garments containing shatnez - the forbidden mixture of wool and linen sold to gentiles. Merchants slung their wares across their shoulders for display, and though some protection is afforded thereby and it is like wearing them, it is permitted.

¹⁵ The work of extinguishing is not needed per se but merely to effect something else, e.g., to spare the oil, and it is Rabbi Yehudah who maintains that such work involves liability.

¹⁶ 'He is exempt' implies that it is actually forbidden.

¹⁷ Since there is no danger of life, it is prohibited like any other work.

¹⁸ That no liability is incurred on account of a labor not required for itself.



Shlomo said, 'And I praise the dead that are already dead' for when the Jews sinned in the wilderness, Moshe stood before the Holy One, Blessed be He, and uttered many prayers and supplications before Him, but he was not answered. Yet when he exclaimed, 'Remember Avraham, Yitzchak, and Yisrael, your servants!' he was immediately answered. Didn't then Shlomo well say, and I praise the dead that are already dead'?

Another interpretation: In worldly affairs, when a prince of flesh and blood issues a decree, it is doubtful whether it will be obeyed or not; and even if you say that it is obeyed, it is obeyed during his lifetime but not after his death. Whereas Moshe our Teacher decreed many decrees and enacted numerous enactments, and they endure forever and unto all eternity. Didn't then Shlomo well say, 'And I praise the dead, etc.'

Another interpretation [of] 'and I praise, etc.' is in accordance with Rav Yehudah's dictum in Rav's name, viz., What is meant by, Shoew me a sign for good, that my enemies may see it, and be ashamed? Dovid prayed before the Holy One, Blessed be He, 'Master of the Universe! Forgive me for that sin!'¹⁹ 'It is forgiven,' replied God. Dovid said to God, 'Show for me a sign in my lifetime.' Hashem responded to him, 'During your lifetime, I will not show it, but in the lifetime of your son Shlomo I will show it.' When Shlomo built the Holy Temple and sought to bring the Aron (ark) inside the Holy of Holies, the gates of the Holy of Holies would not open whereupon the gates clung to each other. Shlomo uttered twenty-four prayers, yet he was not answered. He opened [his mouth] and exclaimed, 'Lift up your heads, O gates; and be lifted up, you everlasting doors: And the King of glory shall come in. They rushed upon him to swallow him up, crying, 'Who is the king of glory?' 'The Lord, strong and mighty,' answered he. Then he repeated, 'Lift up your heads, O gates; Yea, lift them up, you everlasting doors: and the King of glory shall come in. Who is this King of glory? The Lord of hosts, He is the King of glory. Selah'; yet he was not answered. But as soon as he prayed, 'Hashem God, do not turn away the face of Your anointed one! Remember the good deeds of Dovid your servant,' he was immediately answered. In that hour the faces of all David's enemies turned [black] like the bottom of a pot, and all Israel knew that the Holy One, Blessed be He, had

forgiven him that sin. Didn't then Shlomo well say, and I praise the dead which are already dead'? And thus it is written, On the eighth day he sent the people away, and they blessed the king, and went into their tents joyful and glad of heart for all the goodness that Hashem had showed unto Dovid his servant, and to Israel his people.

'And they went unto their tents' [means] that they found their wives clean; 'joyful', because they had enjoyed the radiance of the Divine Presence; 'and glad of heart', because their wives conceived and each one bore a male child; 'for all the goodness that Hashem had shewed unto Dovid his servant', that He had forgiven him that sin; and to Israel his people', for He had forgiven them the sin of [eating on] Yom Kippur. (30a)

And as to what Shlomo said, 'for a living dog is better than a dead lion', — that is as Rav Yehudah said in Rav's name, viz.; what is meant by the verse, Hashem, make me to know my end, and the measure of my days, what it is; let me know how frail I am. David said before the Holy One, Blessed be He, 'Master of the Universe! Lord, make me to know my end.'²⁰ 'It is a decree before Me,' replied He, 'that the end of a mortal is not made known.' 'And the measure of my days, what it is'—it is a decree before Me that a person's span [of life] is not made known.' 'Let me know how frail I am.' Said He to him. 'You will die on the Shabbos.' 'Let me die on the first day of the week!'²¹ 'The reign of your son Shlomo shall already have become due, and one reign may not overlap another even by a hairbreadth.' 'Then let me die on the eve of the Shabbos!' Said He, 'For a day in your courts is better than a thousand': better is to Me the one day that you sit and engage in learning than the thousand burnt-offerings which your son Shlomo is destined to sacrifice before Me on the altar.'

Now, every Shabbos day he would sit and study all day.²² On the day that his soul was to be at rest, the Angel of death stood before him but could not prevail against him, because learning did not cease from his mouth. 'What shall I do to him?' said he. Now, there was a garden before his house; so the Angel of death went, ascended and shook the trees. He [Dovid] went out to see: as he was ascending the ladder, it broke under him. Thereupon

¹⁹ Dovid had a relationship with Bathsheva, the wife of Uriah Hachiti, who was on the battlefield. Although Hashem told Dovid that his sin was forgiven, Dovid desired a sign in his lifetime that would clearly demonstrate that he had repented.

²⁰ Dovid desired to know when he would die.

²¹ The following day, so that the usual offices for the dead may be performed, some of which are forbidden on the Shabbos.

²² As Torah study protects one from death.



he became silent [from his studies] and his soul had repose. Then Shlomo sent to Beis Hamidrash: My father is dead and lying in the sun; and the dogs of my father's house are hungry; what shall I do? They sent back, Cut up a carcass and place it before the dogs; and as for your father, put a loaf of bread or a child upon him and carry him away. Didn't then Shlomo well say, for a living dog is better than a dead lion?

And as for the question which I asked before you, — a lamp is designated lamp, and the soul of man is called a lamp: better it is that the lamp of flesh and blood be extinguished before the lamp of the Holy One, Blessed be He. (30a – 30b)

Rav Yehudah son of Rav Shmuel bar Shilas said in Rav's name: The Sages wished to hide the Book of Koheles, because its words are self-contradictory; yet why did they not hide it? Because its beginning is words of Torah and its end is words of Torah. Its beginning is words of Torah, as it is written, What profit has man of all his labor wherein he labors under the sun? And the School of Rabbi Yannai commented: Under the sun he has none, but he has it [sc. profit] before the sun. The end thereof is words of Torah, as it is written, Let us hear the conclusion of the matter, fear God, and keep his commandments: for this is the whole of man. What is meant by, 'for this is the whole of man'?—Said Rabbi Elozar, The entire world was created only for the sake of this [type of] man. Shimon ben Azzai-others state, Shimon ben Zoma-said: The entire world was created only to be a companion to this man.

And how are its words self-contradictory?—It is written, anger is better than play; but it is written, I said of laughter, it is to be praised. It is written, Then I commended joy; but it is written, and of joy [I said] What does it?" There is no difficulty: 'anger is better than laughter': the anger which the Holy One, Blessed be He, displays to the righteous in this world is better than the laughter which the Holy One, Blessed be He, laughs with the wicked in this world. 'And I said of laughter, it is to be praised': that refers to the laughter which the Holy One, Blessed be He, laughs with the righteous in the World to Come. 'Then I commended joy': this refers to the joy of a mitzvah. 'And of joy [I said], what does it': this refers to joy [which is] not in connection with a mitzvah. This teaches you that the Divine Presence rests [upon] man] neither through gloom, nor through laziness, nor through frivolity, nor through levity, nor through talk, nor through idle chatter, save through a matter of joy in

connection with a mitzvah, as it is said, But now bring me a musician; and it came to pass, when the musician played, that the hand of Hashem came upon him.

Rav Yehudah said: And it is likewise thus for a matter of halachah. Rava said: And it is likewise thus for a good dream. But that is not so, for Rav Giddal said in Rav's name: If any scholar sits before his teacher and his lips do not drip bitterness, they shall be burnt, for it is said, his lips are as lilies [shoshanim], dropping liquid myrrh [mor'ober]: read not mor'ober, but mar'ober [dropping bitterness]; read not shoshanim but sheshonin [that study]? There is no difficulty: the former applies to the teacher; the latter to the disciple. Alternatively, both refer to the teacher, yet there is no difficulty: the one means before he commences; the other, after he commences. Even as Rabbah before he commenced [his discourse] before the scholars used to say something humorous, and the scholars were cheered; after that he sat in awe and began the discourse.

The Book of Mishlei too they desired to hide, because its statements are self-contradictory. Yet why did they not hide it? They said, Did we not examine the Book of Koheles and find a reconciliation? So here too let us make search. And how are its statements self-contradictory?—It is written, Answer not a fool according to his folly; yet it is also written, Answer a fool according to his folly? There is no difficulty: the one refers to matters of learning; the other to general matters. Even as a certain person came before Rebbe and said to him, 'Your wife is my wife and your children are mine.' 'Would you like to drink a glass of wine?' asked he. He drank and burst. A certain man came before Rabbi Chiya and said to him, 'Your mother is my wife and you are my son! Would you like to drink a glass of wine?' asked he. He drank and burst. Rabbi Chiya observed: Rebbe's prayer was in-so-far effective that his sons were not made illegitimate. For when Rebbe prayed he used to say, May it be Your will, Hashem our God, to save me this day from the impudent and from impudence.

'Matters of learning'—what is that?—As Rabban Gamliel sat and lectured, Woman is destined to bear every day, for it is said, the woman conceived and bore simultaneously. But a certain disciple scoffed at him, quoting, 'there is no new thing under the sun.' Come, and I will show you its equal in this world, he replied. He went forth and showed him a fowl. On another occasion Rabban Gamliel sat and lectured, Trees are destined to yield fruit



every day, for it is said, and it shall bring forth boughs and bear fruit: just as the boughs [exist] every day, so shall there be fruit every day. But a certain disciple scoffed at him, saying, but it is written, 'there is no new thing under the sun!' Come, and I will show you its equal in this world, replied he. He went forth and showed him the caper bush. On another occasion Rabban Gamliel sat and expounded, Eretz Yisroel is destined to bring forth cakes and wool robes, for it is said, There shall be an handful of corn in the land. But a certain disciple scoffed at him, quoting, 'there is no new thing under the sun!' 'Come, and I will show you their equal in this world,' replied he. He went forth and showed him morels and truffles; and for silk robes [he showed him] the bark of a young palm-shoot. (30b)

DAILY MASHAL

Sense of Humor

Rav Shlomo Vohlbe zt"l in his Sefer Alei Shor writes regarding the joy one should have in serving Hashem. Rav Vohlbe writes that one may have a sense of humor, allowing him to see the light in any negative matter, and one who has a sense of humor will enjoy his day.

Rav Vohlbe wonders if a sense of humor is something one can learn, and he posits that if one studies Mussar properly, by studying the positive aspects of life, and then adopting the critical approach, one can develop a proper sense of humor.

Praying that one should die

The *Gemora* states that Dovid HaMelech requested of Hashem that he die one day before his predestined time. Hashem responded that a day that Dovid engaged in Torah study was worth more than a thousand sacrifices that Shlomo HaMelech would offer in the future.

The Ran writes that there are times when one can actually pray for a very sick person to die.

The Tiferes Yisroel asks, why are we not concerned about the continued existence of the sick person?

The Tiferes Yisroel writes that there are times when the person is so distressed, that we must pray for his demise, and there are other instances when afflictions are worse than death.

An illustration of this is when Chananiah, Mishael and Azariah were instructed by Nebuchadnezzar to worship an idol, and had they been tortured, they would have worshipped the idol. Nonetheless, it is certainly forbidden to perform an action that will lead someone closer to death.

What is still difficult is how Dovid HaMelech was allowed to request that he die a day earlier than planned so that the people would be able to tend to his burial.

The *Poras Teinah* suggest that perhaps prayer is permitted because one is not performing an action to hasten the persons death, but to request from a gentile to kill a person is certainly forbidden.

Wanting to Save

Our *Mishna* says that he who extinguishes a light because he is afraid is exempt. If he does so *kechass* - to save - the lamp or the oil, he is guilty.

The Vilna Gaon explains that though that person extinguishes the light because he wants to save the oil and believes that he gains thereby, in truth, a person's wherewithal is exacted for him, with the exception of Shabbos expenses. "*Kechass* - As though he wants to save..." In truth, he saves nothing as the expense of the lamp doesn't cost him anything.

Better Than the Chazon Ish!

After the the funeral of the Chazon Ish on 16 Cheshvan 5714, HaGaon Rav E.M. Shach zt"l entered the Ponivezh Yeshivah and found a single student learning. He revealed to him his thoughts: "Though there was no one like the Chazon Ish, Shlomo already said that the live dog is better than the dead lion! Now we're better than the Chazon Ish: We can study Torah!"