

15 Adar I 5774
Feb. 15, 2014



Sukkah Daf 12

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Materials for covering the sukkah

When Rav Dimi came, he quoted Rabbi Yochanan saying that the source for the material required for schach is the verse which commands that we make *chag hasukos – the holiday of sukkos*, comparing the sukkah to the chagiga offering. Just as the chagigah is an animal, which cannot become impure, and grows off the ground, so the sukkah must be covered with similar materials.

The Gemora challenges this source, as we should then require that the sukkah be covered with something which was alive, like the chagigah offering.

When Ravin came, he quoted Rabbi Yochanan saying that the source is the verse which states that we celebrate *Sukkos b’aspecha migarnecha umiyikvecha – when you gather in [your produce] from your silos and presses*, which teaches that the sukkah’s covering should be constructed with the refuse of the silos and presses, which grow from the ground, but cannot become impure.

The Gemora challenges this, as perhaps it means that the covering must be from the produce itself, which can become impure.

Rabbi Zaira says that it cannot mean that, since the verse mentions a press, whose produce is liquid (wine or oil).

Rabbi Yirmiyah rejects this, since it may refer to congealed wine from Snir, which is as solid as pressed fruit cakes.

Rabbi Zaira remarked that we thought we had an answer to our question, until Rabbi Yirmiyah came and knocked it down with an ax.

Rav Ashi answers that the verse says from your silos and from your presses, referring to material that comes from the produce, and not the produce itself.

Rav Chisda says the source is the verse in Nechemia which commands the Jews to go out to the mountain, and take olive branches, branches of oil trees, hadas branches, date branches, and branches of braided leaves (i.e. hadas) to make sukkos, teaching that sukkos are covered with

these materials, which grow from the ground and cannot become impure.

The Gemora asks why the verse refers to hadas branches twice.

Rav Chisda answers that it refers to two different types of hadas – braided hadas, which are valid to fulfill the mitzvah of taking a hadas with the lulav, and plain hadas, which is invalid for the mitzvah of hadas, but which may be used to cover the sukkah.

Covering with bundles

The Mishna says that one may not cover a sukkah with bundles of straw, wood, or reeds, unless he untied them. All of them may be used as walls.

Rabbi Yochanan's two explanations

Rabbi Yaakov says that he heard two explanations from Rabbi Yochanan for this Mishna and the later Mishna which says that a sukkah made by hollowing out the inside of a pile of grain is invalid, but he didn't know which explained which. For one, Rabbi Yochanan said that it was due to a concern of *otzar* – a storehouse, and for the other, he said that it was due to the verse which commands *ta'aseh* – you must make a sukkah, and not have it made by itself (min ha'asui).

Rabbi Yirmiyah says that we can figure out which reason explains which Mishna, by considering Rabbi Chiya bar Abba's statement in the name of Rabbi Yochanan about our Mishna. He explained that one may not cover with bundles since sometimes one may come in from work in the field at night carrying a bundle, and rest it on a hut to let it dry. He may then decide to use it as a covering, but it is invalid, since the verse mandates that we make the sukkah, but this was made by itself, since he didn't put it in place as a roof. Since this Mishna's ruling is because of the concern of a storehouse (i.e., bringing bundles in), we know that the other Mishna must be because of *ta'aseh v'lo min ha'asui*.

The Gemora says that Rabbi Yaakov didn't know Rabbi Chiya bar Abba's statement, and therefore didn't know which reason explained which Mishna.

Rav Ashi challenges Rabbi Yaakov's premise that each Mishna is due to only one concern. Bundles can be an issue of *ta'aseh v'lo min ha'asui*, if one did place them to dry, and digging out a pile can be only a decree, if one dug out and then moved the upper level around for the purpose of a sukkah.

The Gemora explains that Rabbi Yochanan based his explanations on the language of each Mishna. The Mishna about the bundles just says that one may not cover the sukkah with them, implying

that it is valid from the Torah, but Rabbinically one may not do so, while the Mishna about digging out the sukkah says that it isn't a sukkah, implying that it is not valid at all from the Torah.

Arrow handles

Rav Yehudah quotes Rav saying that if one covered the sukkah with arrow handles which are pointy, it is valid, but if one covered it with arrow handles which have a receptacle, it is invalid, since only utensils with receptacles can become impure.

The Gemora asks why he had to teach that the pointy ones are valid, as they cannot become impure, and answers that we may have thought that one should not use them, to prevent one from using the ones with receptacles.

The Gemora asks why he had to teach that the ones with receptacles are invalid, and explains that we may have thought that a receptacle which is meant to be filled in (i.e., with the arrow) is not considered a receptacle.

Linen

Rabbha bar bar Chanah quoted Rabbi Yochanan saying that a sukkah covered with finished bundles of linen is invalid, but one covered with unprocessed bundles of linen is valid. He didn't know what the rule is with a sukkah covered with

hushnim of linen, nor did he know what hushnim are.

The Gemora explains that he wasn't sure if hushnim is flax which was beaten but not combed, but unbeaten flax is considered unprocessed, or if it also includes flax which was soaked and not beaten.

Vegetation

Rav Yehudah says that one may cover the sukkah with shushi and shevatrzi (types of vegetation), since they cannot become impure, since they are eaten only by animals.

Abaye says that one may cover it with shushi, but not with shevatrzi, since they smell bad, and we are concerned that he will therefore exit his sukkah.