

1. Rebbi testified how they practically used Rabbi Shimon's opinion that roofs, yards, and karfeifs are all one domain.

Rebbi says that when they used to learn Torah from Rabbi Shimon in Takoa they would take oil and a towel from roof to roof, from roof to yard, from yard to yard, from yard to karfeif etc. until they would get to their destination. This shows they indeed understood that Rabbi Shimon held these were all one domain on Shabbos (for items that were not in a house when Shabbos arrived).

2. Rabbi Yehuda's proof to this effect was discounted.

Rabbi Yehuda similarly said that during times of persecution they used to bring a sefer torah from yard to roof etc. to read from it on Shabbos. However, he was told that one cannot bring proof from a time of persecution.

3. There is an argument whether Rabbi Shimon would allow carrying freely from one yard to another (as described above) in a yard that has an eiruv.

Rav says that Rabbi Shimon did not permit such carrying from a yard with an eiruv. The reason he

did not permit this is because even Rabbi Shimon agrees that a person may not take out items from a house to a yard that he does not have a part in its eiruv. We are scared that if we permit carrying from a yard that has an eiruv to another yard, one will end up carrying from his house in that yard to the second yard as well. If the yard has no eiruv, one will only carry things that were in the yard when Shabbos arrived, as it is clearly forbidden to carry from any houses to those yards. However, Shmuel and Rabbi Yochanan argue that Rabbi Shimon even said his rule about yards with an eiruv, and he did not make such a decree.

4. Even if Rabbi Shimon holds that this applies to all yards, it is possible that he would still have to say that one cannot carry items that had been in the house.

The Gemora asks why Rabbi Shimon explicitly says in a braisa that one cannot carry items that had been in the house when Shabbos arrived to another yard. According to the opinion that he is also permitting carrying from yard to yard when no eiruv had been made, what would be a case where a Torah-abiding Jew would have brought out items from the house to a yard that requires an eiruv? This would be a Rabbinic prohibition, and Rabbi Shimon therefore would not have had to address

- 1 -

## L'zecher Nishmas HaRav Raphael Dov ben HaRav Yosef Yechezkel Marcus O"H



this! The Gemora answers that the case is where a person was wearing clothes from the house, walked into the yard, and took off an item of clothing in the yard. This is permitted, and is why Rabbi Shimon must note that this item of clothing cannot be carried from yard to yard.

5. There is an argument regarding how far one can carry vessels in a private alleyway where no shituf mevo'os was made.

The Gemora states that Rabbi Zeira said in the name of Rav that one cannot carry four cubits in an private alleyway (mavuy) when no shituf mevo'os was made. The Gemora at first thinks that there is proof to this opinion from a braisa that states "it is forbidden in a mavuy." However, the Gemora rejects this, and says that it means one cannot carry vessels from a yard to a mavuy when no shituf was made.

## **INSIGHTS TO THE DAF**

The Gemora notes that Rabbi Shimon needed to say that one cannot carry items such as clothing, that were in the house when Shabbos entered and transported into the yard while being worn, from one yard to another.

What is the law regarding carrying them inside the yard itself when no eiruv was made? On the one hand, one cannot carry things from the house to the yard. However, once this was done in a permitted way, do we say it is only limited to being carried in the yard? Or do we say it cannot even be carried four cubits in the yard itself (although other items can indeed be carried not only within the entire yard, but even into other yards)?

The Tosfos Rid says it is indeed permitted to carry the clothing throughout the entire yard, even more than four cubits.

The Rashba seems to agree, but asks that if a person takes off clothing in the yard, this confuses the situation greatly, as some things one can carry into other yards while some things cannot be carried. What is the law? In his first answer, the Rashba says that we indeed decree that if a person takes off clothing in the yard, everything in the yard cannot be carried out of the yard. However, in his second answer he says that because it is uncommon that people take off items of clothing in the yard, even if they do it is called "an uncommon occurrence" not included in a decree. According to this second answer, everyone can keep carrying everything else into other yards. The Ritva sides with this second answer.

However, Rebbi Akiva Eiger does not understand why it should be permitted to carry these clothes four cubits. He says it should have a regular law of not being able to carry items in the house that entered a yard without an eiruv, which is that one cannot carry them four cubits.