

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

**Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h**

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

**1. One cannot cook the *korban pesach* (*paschal lamb*) in water or in fruit juice.**

The Torah states explicitly that the *korban pesach* cannot be cooked in water. The *Gemora* quotes an argument as to the source that it also cannot be cooked in fruit juice. The *Tanna Kamma* says that if water that does not take away from the taste is forbidden, certainly fruit juices are forbidden! Rebbe says that this is learned from the verse “*and surely cooked in water,*” telling us that in any liquid it is forbidden. (41a)

**2. Whether or not one can cook a *korban pesach* in a pot without water or juices is dependent on the argument above.**

According to the *Tanna Kamma*, this is permitted, as allowing the natural juices of the meat to pool and end up cooking the meat does not detract from the flavor of the *korban*. However, according to Rebbe, this is forbidden, as the verse is teaching us that it is not allowed to be cooked in any liquid whatsoever, even its own juices. It must be cooked without a pot (*on a spit*) over an open fire. (41a)

**3. A person who eats a piece of the *korban pesach* the size of a *k'zayis* (*olive*) when it is totally raw has not transgressed the verse “do not eat from it when it is “*na* (see below).”**

The *Gemora* explains that the word “*na*” in the verse means somewhat raw, although it has undergone the beginning of the roasting process. Only someone who eats a *korban pesach* in this manner receives lashes for transgressing this verse (see 5. below). Even so, it is still forbidden to eat the *korban pesach* when it is raw, as the verse says “*ki i’ m tzli eish*” – “only roasted over a fire.” (41a)

**4. If one cooks the *korban pesach* in (*something akin to*) the hot springs of Teveria, he transgresses not having eaten the *korban pesach* when it is roasted.**

The *Gemora* says that one who cooks the *korban pesach* in (*something akin to*) the hot springs of Teveria is liable for punishment. The *Gemora* asks that cooking in hot springs is not exactly cooking, as we see that someone who cooks in hot springs on *Shabbos* has not violated cooking on *Shabbos*. The *Gemora* clarifies that the transgression here is not “do not eat from it when it is “*na*” (see above) or cooked,” but rather “only roasted over a fire.” [Being that this verse is only a positive commandment, no punishment is given by *Beis Din* (in this world), which is why the *braisa* says he is exempt (from lashes).] (41a – 41b)



5. If someone eats a piece of the *korban pesach* the size of a *k'zayis* (olive) when it is only slightly cooked on the day before *Pesach* (when the *korban* is brought but not eaten), he has not transgressed the verse "do not eat from it when it is *na*."

The *Gemora* quotes two *braisos* that agree that a person only transgresses this prohibition at a time when the *pesach* is supposed to be eaten, namely *pesach* night. One *braisa* derives this from the extra words "rather only roasted" in the same verse as the prohibition "do not eat it *na*." The *braisa* says that this must indicate that we should compare the two prohibitions. At the same time that there is a *mitzvah* to eat the *korban pesach* roasted, there is a prohibition against eating it when it is "na." When there is no *mitzvah* to eat the *korban pesach* roasted, there is no prohibition against eating it *na*. (41b)

## INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

### *Solar Water Heaters*

Our *Gemora* states that if someone cooks something in the hot springs of Teveria on *Shabbos*, he is not liable for cooking on *Shabbos*. A similar case, where an egg is cooked by placing it in a handkerchief heated by the sun, is discussed at length in the *Gemora* in *Shabbos* (38b). The *Tanna Kamma* says that such an action is forbidden on *Shabbos*, while Rabbi Yosi says it is permitted. The *Gemora* explains that everyone agrees that it is permitted to cook using the natural light of the sun (i.e. placing an egg outside in a very hot spot) on *Shabbos*. Everyone likewise agrees that one cannot

use fire to cook something, even if that fire is being used indirectly (*heating up the metal on the bottom of a pot that contains food that becomes cooked*). The argument is regarding using something that is heated by the sun to in turn cook the food. The *Tanna Kamma* says that this is forbidden according to Rabbinic law (*though permitted according to the Torah*) because one might otherwise end up cooking with fire, while Rabbi Yosi says it is permitted. The codifiers rule like the *Tanna Kamma* (see *Shulchan Aruch Orach Chaim* 318:3)

While this sounds like a case that does not have practical application, it actually is at the heart of an interesting Halachic debate regarding solar water heaters (*used by almost every apartment in Israel*). Is an apparatus that traps the rays of the sun, enabling it to heat the water coursing through its pipes, considered like the hot springs, or as if the sun itself is heating the water? Even if we say that it is more like the hot springs, is there any way that the turning of the faucet, which allows cold water to enter and be cooked by the hot water that is already there, is considered indirect enough that this should be considered permitted when the prohibition to start off with is only a Rabbinic decree? Without getting into the entire topic, there were some *Poskim* who were lenient (see *Har Tzvi Orach Chaim* 1:188 and R' Shlomo Zalman Auerbach in the first edition of *Shemiras Shabbos K'Hilchasah*). However, most *poskim* rule that using the hot water from a solar water heater on *Shabbos* is forbidden (see subsequent versions of *Shemiras Shabbos*, *Minchas Yitzchak* 4:44, and others).

