11 Tishrei 5779 Sept. 20, 2018



Menachos Daf 41

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamot of

Moshe Raphael ben Yehoshua (Morris Stadtmauer) o"h

Tzvi Gershon ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o"h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for their neshamot and may their souls find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

1)	Answer (Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak): The same applies to a
WHEN IS A GARMENT OBLIGATED IN TZITZIS?	Sadin with Techeles. (If it is too small, there is no Mitzvah,
(a)	and it is forbidden due to Kilayim). (This concludes the
(R. Zeira citing Shmuel): Kilayim does not apply to Tzitzis,	rejection of Suggestion (1).)
even if the garment is exempt.	(c)
(b)	Answer: Kilayim does not apply even if one attached Tzitzis
Question: What is the meaning of 'even if the garment is	to a garment that already had Kosher Tzitzis.
exempt'?	(d)
1.	Question: If one does not transgress in this case, surely such
Suggestion: The garment is too small to require Tzitzis.	Tzitzis are Kosher. If so, why did R. Zeira teach the same law
2.	differently (40b, 1:k)?
Rejection (Beraisa): If a garment is big enough to cover the	(e)
head and majority of a child (who is old enough to go in the	Answer: Indeed, he said only one of these (Tosfos - this law,
market by himself), and big enough for an adult to wear on	in the name of Shmuel; Rashi - that law). The other was
occasions, it requires Tzitzis;	inferred from the one he said.
i.	(f)
If it is not big enough to cover the head and majority of a	(Beraisa): If a garment is folded over, it requires Tzitzis (on
child, even if it is big enough for an adult to wear on	the current corners, i.e. two are on the fold);
occasions, it is exempt from Tzitzis;	(g)
ii.	R. Shimon exempts.
The same applies to Kilayim.	1.
3.	All agree that if it was sewn shut, it is obligated.
Question: What is the meaning of 'the same applies to	2.
Kilayim'?	Objection: This is obvious!
i.	3.
Suggestion: Also the Isur of Kilayim does not apply to a	Answer: The case is, it was fastened only with a pin
garment too small for a child.	(alternatively - it was sewn poorly with wide stitches).
ii.	(h)
Rejection (Mishnah): The Isur of Kilayim does not depend on	Rabah bar Rav Huna saw that Rava bar Rav Nachman was
whether one would wear the garment on occasions.	wearing a folded garment. It had Tzitzis on the fold. He
4.	unfolded it. (Two of) the Tzitzis were now in the middle.
	1.
-1-	



Rabah: The Torah requires Tzitzis on the corner. They are not there!

2.

Rava took off the garment.

3.

Rabah: Do you think that Tzitzis is a Chovas Adam (it is obligatory only when one wears the garment)?! No, it is Chovas Talis (one must put Tzitzis on every garment he owns (and sometimes wears)). Go put Tzitzis on the corner! (i)

Support (for Rabah - Beraisa): Tzadikim of old would put Tzitzis once they had woven the three fingers of the garment. (Rashba - if it were Chovas Adam, it would be a stringency to put Tzitzis on once it was finished, before wearing it. They would not be so exceedingly stringent to do so before it was finished!)

(j)

Rejection: They were exceedingly stringent.

(k)

Rabah argues with an angel;

1.

Rav Ketina was wearing a Sadin. (Chachamim decreed not to put Tzitzis on it. Some explain that it had Lavan, but not Techeles.)

2.

An angel: You wear a Sadin in summer, and a rounded (twocornered) coat in winter. You never fulfill the Mitzvah of Techeles (some texts - Tzitzis)!

3.

Rav Ketina: Do you punish for not fulfilling an (optional) Mitzvas Aseh?!

4.

The angel: When Hash-m is angry, we do!

5.

Granted, if Tzitzis is a Chovas Adam, Rav Ketina was liable for not wearing Tzitzis. However, if it is a Chovas Talis, he is blameless!

(I)

Objection: Even if Tzitzis is a Chovas Adam, one is not liable unless he is wearing a garment that is obligated!

(m)

Answer: In any case, one (Nimukei Yosef - a great person) should not seek ways to avoid the Mitzvah. (Tosfos - this applies only if it is Chovas Adam. Rashi - this even applies to Chovas Talis. We cannot infer the angel's opinion.)

(n)

(Shmuel): Garments (that one will wear) require Tzitzis, even when they are in a box.

1.

Shmuel agrees that a garment prepared for shrouds is exempt (Nimukei Yosef - even though he occasionally wears it in his lifetime).

2.

When he dies, we put Tzitzis on the shrouds, to avoid mocking him (that he is exempt from Mitzvos) - "Lo'eg la'Rash Cheref Osehu".

2)

TRANSFERRING TZITZIS TO ANOTHER GARMENT

(a)

(Rachbah): If a garment was torn more than three fingers from the corner, we may fix it (and the Tzitzis are Kosher); 1.

If it tore within three fingers of the corner, we may not fix it. (Rashi - perhaps some of the strings used to fix it will be left hanging on the corner for the sake of Tzitzis, and they are Pasul, for they were not attached l'Shem Tzitzis. Tosfos (40b DH Shema) - once it tore, all the Tzitzis are disqualified. They must be removed and reattached after fixing it. Rosh - we may never put Tzitzis on, even after fixing the corner.) (b)

Support (Beraisa): If a garment was torn more than three fingers from the corner, we may fix it;

1.

R. Meir says, if it tore within three fingers, we may not fix it; (Hagahos Maimoni - this supports Rachbah, for the Halachah follows R. Meir's decrees. Nimukei Yosef switches the opinions of R. Meir and Chachamim; the support is from Chachamim.)

2.

Chachamim permit fixing it.



(f)

All agree that one may not bring even a large piece of material (with Techeles on it) from another garment and attach it;

4.

3.

All agree that one may bring Techeles strings (taken from another garment) and attach them, on condition that they were not cut.

41b-----41b

5.

Inference: One may remove Tzitzis from a garment to attach them to another garment!

6.

Rejection: Perhaps they may be removed only from a wornout garment.

(c)

(Beraisa #1): If a garment is entirely Techeles, strings of any color fulfill the Mitzvah of Lavan, except for Kala Ilan.

(d)

Contradiction (Beraisa #2): Lavan strings must be of the same color (Rashi; Tosfos - material, unless they are wool or linen) as the garment;

1.

If a garment is entirely Techeles, one attaches Techeles strings and a different color for Lavan. He should not use Kala llan;

2.

If he used Kala Ilan, he fulfilled the Mitzvah.

(e)

Version #1 - Resolution (Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak): Beraisa #2 discusses a garment with four strings. (All the strings are needed, so we are not concerned lest one transfer them to another garment);

1.

Beraisa #1 discusses a garment with eight strings (on each corner, four Techeles and four Kala Ilan. Chachamim decreed to disqualify Kala Ilan, lest someone buy the garment and think that all the strings are Techeles, and transfer some to another garment. One of the garments will have Kala Ilan in place of Techeles).

- 3 -

Version #2 - Resolution (Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak): Beraisa
#2 refers to a garment with eight strings. (Each corner has two Techeles strings and two Lavan (or some other color that does not resemble Techeles), and four Kala Ilan are added.
L'Chatchilah this is forbidden, lest the Kala Ilan be transferred and used in place of Techeles);

1.

Beraisa #1 refers to a garment with four strings (on each corner, two Techeles and two Kala Ilan. To fulfill Techeles and Lavan, the strings must be of recognizably different colors.) (end of Version #2)

(g)

Inference: Since such a decree was made, this teaches that one may remove Tzitzis from a garment to attach them to another garment!

(h)

Rejection: Perhaps it is forbidden. Chachamim decreed lest people (improperly) do so.

(i)

(Rav): One may not remove Tzitzis from a garment to attach them to another garment.

(j)

(Shmuel): It is permitted.

(k)

(Rav): One may not light one Ner Chanukah from another. (This looks like a disgrace of the Mitzvah);

(I)

(Shmuel): It is permitted.

(m)

(Rav): The Halachah does not follow R. Shimon (one may not drag something on a dirt floor on Shabbos if it might make a furrow. This is like plowing);

(n)

(Shmuel): The Halachah follows R. Shimon. (It is permitted.) (o)

(Abaye): Wherever Rav and Shmuel argue, my Rebbi (Rabah) always followed (Tosfos Shabbos - the stringencies of) Rav, except for the above three places.

1.



(Beraisa - R. Shimon): One may drag a bed, chair or bench on a dirt floor, as long as one does not intend to make a furrow.(p)

Rav Yehudah would give his garment (with Techeles) to a launderer. (Rashi - he was not concerned lest a string of Techeles snap, and the launderer will replace it with Kala Ilan. R. Gershom - he would pay nicely so the launderer would be careful that the color not fade);

(q)

Rav Chanina would fold the Techeles strings together (R. Gershom - wrap them in other strings) to protect them (when giving the garment to a launderer);

(r)

Ravina would fold the garment over them and sew it shut. **3**)

HOW MANY STRINGS ARE REQUIRED?

(a)

(Beraisa #1) Question: How many strings are required? (b)

Answer #1 (Beis Shamai): Four strings are required. (They are put through the corner and doubled over, making eight ends);

(c)

Answer #2 (Beis Hillel): Three strings are required (six ends). (d)

Question: How long should be Meshulash? (Rashi - this is what hangs down straight; Tosfos - it is the windings and knots. It is half as long as what hangs straight.)

(e)

Answer #1 (Beis Shamai): Four Etzba'os (finger-widths) are required;

(f)

Answer #2 (Beis Hillel): Three Etzba'os are required;

1.

Each Etzba (of Beis Hillel) is a quarter of a handbreadth of an average person.

(g)

(Rav Papa): Whenever the Torah requires a Tefach, this is the width of four thumbs, which equals the width of six pinkies

or five (Shitah Mekubetzes - and a third) intermediate (index) fingers.

(h)

(Rav Huna): Four strings are required. They must be within four Etzba'os of the corner. Four Etzba'os must be Meshulash;

(i)

(Rav Yehudah): Three strings are required. They must be within three Etzba'os of the corner. Three Etzba'os must be Meshulash.

(j)

(Rav Papa): The Halachah requires four strings within three Etzba'os. Four Etzba'os must be Meshulash.

(k)

Inference: The Beraisa implies that there is a Shi'ur (minimal length) of Tzitzis.

(I)

Contradiction (Beraisa #2): Tzitzis must extend somewhat past the corner. Mashehu (any amount) is Kosher;

1.

Elders of Beis Hillel and Beis Shamai: There is no Shi'ur of Tzitzis. Similarly, there is no Shi'ur of a Lulav.

2.

Suggestion: This means that there is no Shi'ur at all! (m)

Answer: No, it means that there is no upper Shi'ur, but there is a minimal length.

POINT BY POINT OUTLINE OF THE DAF

prepared by Rabbi Pesach Feldman of Kollel Iyun Hadaf, Yerushalayim

> <u>daf@dafyomi.co.il</u>, <u>www.dafyomi.co.il</u> Rosh Kollel: Rabbi Mordecai Kornfeld