5 Shevat 5779 Jan. 11, 2019



Chullin Daf 45

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamot of

Moshe Raphael ben Yehoshua (Morris Stadtmauer) o"h

Tzvi Gershon ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o"h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for their neshamot and may their souls find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Like a Sieve

Rav Yehudah said in the name of Rav: If the trachea was punctured with many holes like a sieve, they combine together in order to make up the greater part (of the trachea's circumference).

Rabbi Yirmiyah asked from the following *braisa*: If there was one long hole in the skull, or even if there were many small holes in it, they combine to make up the measure of a hole bored by a drill (*and if it is larger than that, the skull will no longer convey tumah to people or vessels that are in the same room or under the same roof*). We therefore see that if the measure is that of a hole the size of a drill, several small holes combine together so as to make up this measure; similarly, we should say here, since its measure (*to define what constitutes a deficiency in the trachea*) is that of a hole the size of an *issar* (*a small coin; its size is less than the greater part of the trachea*), several small holes shall combine together to make up a hole the size of an *issar*?

The *Gemora* answers: Rabbi Yirmiyah obviously forgot that which Rabbi Chelbo said in the name of Rav Chama bar Gurya in the name of Rav: Holes with loss of skin combine together to make up the measure of a hole the size of an *issar*, but holes without any loss of skin (*mere punctures*) combine together to make up the greater part of the circumference (and that is what Rav Yehudah was referring to). (45a)

Defects in the Trachea

Rabbah bar bar Chanah said in the name of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi: If a strip of the trachea was removed, its space combines to make up a hole the size of an *issar* (*and if it is larger than that, the animal is a tereifah*).

Rabbi Yitzchak bar Nachmeini inquired of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi: What is the law if the trachea was punctured like a sieve? He replied: They have said: Holes with loss of skin combine together to make up the measure of a hole the size of an *issar*, but holes without any loss of skin (*mere punctures*) combine together to make up the greater part of the circumference (*and that is what Rav Yehudah was referring to*).

The Gemora asks: What is the halachah regarding a bird (if its trachea was punctured like a sieve, for it must be less than the size of an issar coin)?

Rabbi Yitzchak bar Nachmeini said: It was explained to me by Rabbi Elozar as follows: It (*the three sides around the perforated area*) must be cut out and folded over the opening of the trachea; if it covers the greater part of the trachea, the bird is a *tereifah*, but if not, it is



permitted. [By a bird, we reckon with the skin between the holes (even though that skin is still remaining).]

Rav Nachman said: If the trachea was opened in the shape of a door (*it was cut in a manner that formed a flap*), it is *tereifah* if an *issar* can pass through it easily.

Rav said: If the trachea was split lengthwise, it is permitted, provided there remained intact at least one ring (or according to Rashi's preferred explanation – a group of three rings) above it and one below it.

When this was reported to Rabbi Yochanan, he remarked: Why a ring? Why does Rav require a ring? Rather say that it is permitted, provided that there remains a small portion above it and a small portion below it. When this same ruling was reported to Rabbi Yochanan in the name of Rabbi Yonasan, he exclaimed: Our Babylonian friends (*for R' Yonasan was initially from Bavel*) know how to explain the law correctly! (45a)

Place of Shechitah

Rabbi Chiya bar Yosef taught the following *braisa* in the presence of Rabbi Yochanan: The entire neck is the appropriate place for *shechitah* — that is, from the great ring until the wings (*the lobes*) of the lower lung.

[This is the kaneh; the trachea. It was sent to me by Rabbi Simon Wolf: <u>http://www.swdaf.com/</u>. We thank him profusely. The cricoids cartilage is the 'great ring.']



Rava said: When the *braisa* says 'the lower lung,' it really means 'the upper lung.' [*The upper lung is lower when the animal is hanging from its hind legs. When one is holding the detached trachea and the lungs are dangling below, it is the 'upper lung.'*] For I hold that the proper place for *shechitah* is the entire extent of the neck observed at the time when the animal stretches out its neck while grazing, but not when it is stretched by force.

[Rabbi Yaakov Lach, in section 3 of his masterpiece of a sefer, Chullin Illuminated writes: The upper lobes of the lung extend upward and outward like wings. The trachea continues past them, and only further below does it actually enter into the lung itself. Shechitah is only kosher up to the point where the trachea enters between the upper wings of the inflated lung. This halachah is important to the laws of tereifos as well, for this bottom most section of the trachea is treated as an extension of the lung. It is thus rendered tereifah with a mere puncture, unlike the trachea proper which is tereifah only when cut in the majority of its circumference.]

Rav Chanina, and others say Rav Chanahnya inquired: What is the law if the animal of its own accord stretched its neck (during the shechitah; this caused that more of the trachea was found in the neck area than usual)?



The Gemora leaves this question unresolved.

Rabbi Yochanan and Rabbi Shimon ben Lakish were once sitting together and they agreed upon the following rulings: If one stretched the pipes of the animal by force (*into the neck area*) and slaughtered in the extended part, the slaughtering is invalid. If the trachea was punctured below the breast (which is at a point that is not valid for *shechitah*), it is considered as if the lungs were punctured (*and is ruled a tereifah; if the trachea was punctured in the appropriate place of shechitah, it is not rendered a tereifah until its greater part was severed*).



[We once again thank Rabbi Amitai ben-David for allowing us to use his illustrations from his masterpiece of a sefer: Sichas Chullin. The picture on the top left depicts the ordinary position of the trachea. The picture on the right demonstrates that when the animal extends its neck to graze, part of the trachea, which was initially not found in the neck area, enters into that area, and that part is an appropriate place for shechitah. The illustration on the bottom, however, shows that more of

- 3 -

the trachea can be pulled into the neck area by force; that extra portion is not valid for shechitah.]

The Gemora cites a braisa: What is regarded as the breast (which, by a shelamim offering, is given to the Kohen)? It is that portion which looks down upon the ground (for no ribs, located on the sides of the animal, need to be cut in order to remove the animal's breast from the bottom); and it extends as far as down as the neck, and upward as far as the paunch. One cuts two ribs from the two sides (of the neck), on this side and on that (one from each), and this is the breast which is to be given to the Kohanim. (45a)

Brain

The *Mishna* had stated that if the membrane of the brain was punctured, it is a *tereifah*.

Rav and Samuel both said: If only the upper membrane only was punctured, even though the lower was not, it is still a *tereifah* (*for the lower one, being weak, cannot protect the brain by itself*). Others say that they said that it is not a *tereifah* unless the lower membrane was punctured as well.

Rabbi Shimon ben Pazi said in the name of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi in the name of Bar Kappara: Everything that is within the cranium is regarded as the brain; from the point at which it begins to extend (beyond the cranium), it is regarded as the spinal cord. [A mere puncture in the brain renders it a tereifah; a puncture in the spinal cord, however, does not render the animal a tereifah; it is only if the greater part of the membrane surrounding it becomes severed.]



Rabbi Yitzchak bar Nachmeini said: It was explained to me by Rabbi Yehoshua ben *Levi* that there are two beanshaped structures that lie at the entrance of the cranium; whatever lies on the inside of these structures is regarded as within the cranium (*and is therefore considered part of the brain*), and whatever lies on the outside of these structures is regarded as outside the cranium (*and therefore considered part of the spinal cord*). As to the beans themselves (*that which lies directly opposite these structures – according to Rashi*), I do not know not how to regard it. It is likely, however, to regard it as within the cranium (*and is therefore considered part of the brain*). Rabbi Yirmiyah once examined the skull of a bird and found these two beanshaped structures at the entrance of the cranium.



[We once again thank Rabbi Amitai ben-David for allowing us to use his illustrations from his masterpiece of a sefer: Sichas Chullin. There are several opinions as to the meaning of the "bean-shape structures." Some say that the reference is to the occipital condyles, which can be seen on the bottom picture on opposite ends of the spinal cord.] (45a – 45b)

Heart

The *Mishna* had stated: if the heart was punctured as far as the cavity, it is a *tereifah*.

Rabbi Zeira inquired: Does the *Mishna* mean as far as the small chamber (*right ventricle*) or as far as the large chamber (*left ventricle*)?

Abaye said to him: Why are you in doubt? Have we not learned in our *Mishna* (*regarding the lungs*) that Rabbi Shimon said it is only a *tereifah* if it was punctured as far as the bronchi; and this was explained to us by Rabbah bar Tachlifa in the name of Rabbi Yirmiyah bar Abba in the name of Rav to mean that the lung must be punctured as far as the large bronchi (*situated in each of the main lobes*)? [*Evidently, we always refer to the primary or large one!*]

The *Gemora* replies: There is no comparison at all! There it says: as far as the bronchi (*and he uses the plural 'bronchi'*), which indicates that it is the center into which all the bronchi tubes converge (*which is the large bronchi*); but here, it says: as far as the cavity. What does it matter whether it is the large or small chamber? [*Accordingly, the law is that the animal is rendered a tereifah if any of the heart's chambers were punctured*.] (45b)

Pipes of the Heart

There is a dispute regarding the pipes of the heart. Rav says: The slightest puncture in them will render the animal a *tereifah*. Shmuel says: It is a *tereifah* only if the greater part of it was severed.

Visit us on the web at dafnotes.com or email us at info@dafnotes.com to subscribe © Rabbi Avrohom Adler L'zecher Nishmas HaRav Raphael Dov ben HaRav Yosef Yechezkel Marcus O"H



Rabbah bar Yitzchak said in the name of Rav that the pipes of the heart refer to the fat which runs along the walls.

The Gemora notes that it is absurd to think that we are referring to the fat on the walls of the animal (for that is not vital at all); but rather, we are referring to the fat on the walls of the lungs (which, according to Rashi, means the aorta, the artery which transports the oxygenated blood from the heart's left ventricle to all the other arteries in the body).

Ameimar said in the name of Rav Nachman: There are three main vessels (that the trachea enters the chest, it splits into three pipes): one leads to the heart, the other to the lungs and the third to the liver. [See Rashi and the commentators for the determination as to which 'pipes' the Gemora is referring to, for the trachea, in truth, does not lead to the heart or the liver.] The one that leads to the lungs is regarded as the lungs (and is a tereifah through a mere puncture); the one that leads to the liver is regarded as the liver (and is not a tereifah unless it is completely removed); with regard to the one that leads to the heart there is a dispute (the dispute mentioned above between Rav and Shmuel). Mar bar Chiya cites a different version: The one that leads to the lungs is regarded as the liver; the one that leads to the liver is regarded as the lungs; with regard to the one that leads to the heart there is a dispute (the dispute mentioned above between Rav and Shmuel).

Rabbi Chiya bar Yosef went and reported Rav's opinion to Shmuel. Shmuel said: If this is what Abba (*referring to Rav*) said, then he knows nothing about the *halachos* of *tereifos*. (45b)

DAILY MASHAL

A butcher told the Chofetz Chaim that he was planning to give up his position as shochet, because the responsibility is awesome. "One tiny error, and I cause someone to eat tereifah. I think I will go into business."

The Chofetz Chaim said, "That is indeed a serious consideration. Yet, while tereifah is a grievous sin, it is only one sin. But are you aware of the number of potential sins involved in doing business? One may overcharge, one may take interest on credit, one may bad-mouth a competitor, one may unwittingly sell defective merchandise, one may take a false oath, and a number of others." The Chofetz Chaim, who zealously cherished every moment to be able to study Torah, spent many hours personally examining every sefer he sold, lest there be a defective page.

Sometimes a person may engage in a halachically improper manner "because everyone does it. That's 'the way of business." That does not change the fact that it is a violation of halachah.

It is important that we know the halachic guidelines for doing business.