



Chullin Daf 93



Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamot of

Moshe Raphael ben Yehoshua (Morris Stadtmauer) o"h Tzvi Gershon ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o"h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for their neshamot and may their souls find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

[To revert to] the above text. Rabbi Abba said in the name of Rav Yehudah on the authority of Shmuel: Fat that is covered with flesh is permitted.

23 Adar I 5779

Feb. 28, 2019

The Gemora asks: But this cannot be, for hasn't Rabbi Abba also said in the name of Rav Yehudah on the authority of Shmuel that the fat which is under the loins is forbidden?¹

Abaye answered: An animal while alive has its limbs dislocated.²

This is as Rabbi Yochanan said: I am no butcher nor the son of a butcher, but I remember this statement that was generally quoted in the Beis Hamidrash: An animal while alive has its limbs dislocated.

Rabbi Abba said in the name of Rav Yehudah on the authority of Shmuel: The fat which is upon the omasum and reticulum is forbidden and one is liable to the penalty of Kares on account of it; this is the fat that is 'upon the innards'.

Rabbi Abba further said in the name of Rav Yehudah on the authority of Shmuel: The fat which is upon the klibusta³ is forbidden and one is liable to the penalty of Kares on account of it; this is the 'fat which is upon the flanks'.

Rabbi Abba further said in the name of Rav Yehudah on the authority of Shmuel: The threads⁴ in the foreleg are forbidden.

Rav Safra said: You Moses! Does the Merciful One forbid the eating of meat?

Rava replied: You Moses! Does the Merciful One allow the eating of blood? But if it [the foreleg] was cut and salted it may even [be cooked] in a pot.⁵

Rav Yehudah said in the name of Shmuel: [The fat upon] the first cubit of the intestines must be scraped away; this is the 'fat upon the intestines'.

Rav Yehudah said: The 'threads' (veins) in the hip are forbidden. There are five veins in the flanks: three on the right side and two on the left. Each one of the three veins branches into two, and each one of the two veins branches into three. The practical importance of this is that if one removes them while the flesh is still warm (immediately after the animal's slaughter), they will slip out easily, otherwise, one must dig them up [to this number].

⁵ The veins in the foreleg are forbidden only on account of the blood contained in them; if therefore the veins are removed or the meat was cut up prior to the salting, it is permitted.





¹ Although this fat is covered by the loins.

² When the animal is in motion its limbs and muscles slip away from their normal positions and are temporarily dislocated. Consequently the fat under the loins is not always covered with flesh, and it is therefore forbidden.

³ innominate bone; I.e., the hip-bone. This refers to the sacrum.

⁴ small veins



Abaye (others say: Rav Yehudah) said: There are five (groups of) threads (that are forbidden): three are forbidden on account of fat and two on account of blood. The veins in the spleen, in the flanks and in the kidneys are forbidden on account of fat; those in the foreleg and in the cheeks on account of blood. What is the practical difference here? — Those forbidden on account of blood, if cut up and salted may be eaten; but the others have no remedy at all.

Rav Kahana (others say: Rav Yehudah) said: There are five membranes, three are forbidden on account of fat, and two on account of blood; that of the spleen, the flanks, and the kidneys is forbidden on account of fat; that of the testicles and of the brain on account of blood.

Rav Yehudah bar Oshayia was once scraping [the fat from] the spleen for Levi the son of Rav Huna bar Chiya, and was cutting away [the fat] only at the upper section, whereupon the latter said to him, "Go lower down too." When his father came and found him doing this, he said: Thus said your mother's father (that is, Rabbi Yirmiyah bar Abba) in the name of Rav: The Torah forbade only [the fat] at the top. Levi asked: But this surely cannot be, for Rav Hamnuna reported that a Tanna taught: The membrane which is upon the spleen is forbidden but one is not liable on account of it. Now what can this mean? If it means, [the fat] which is at the top, then why is one not liable on account of it? It must therefore mean the fat over the whole [of the spleen]! — He replied: If it was so taught then it was taught.

[To revert to] the main text: Rav Hamnuna reported that a Tanna taught: The membrane which is upon the spleen is forbidden but one is not liable on account of it. The membrane which is upon the kidney is forbidden but one is not liable on account of it.

The Gemora asks: But it has been taught: One is liable on account of it!

The Gemora answers: With regard to the spleen there is no contradiction because the latter ruling refers to the fat which is at the top and the former to that which is not at the top. And with regard to the kidney there is no contradiction because the latter ruling refers to the upper membrane and the former to the lower membrane.⁶

As to (mainly) detached testicles [there is a dispute between] Rav Ammi and Rav. Assi, one forbids them and the other permits them. He who forbids them [argues thus]: since they will never recover, they are to be considered as a limb torn loose from the living animal. And he who permits them [argues thus]: since they do not decay there is obviously vitality in them. And the former? — He maintains that they do not decay only because the outside air does not penetrate into them. And the latter? — He maintains that they do not recover only because emaciation has set in.

Rabbi Yochanan said to Rav Shemen bar Abba: (mainly) detached testicles are permitted, but you must not eat them, for it is written: Forsake not the teaching of your mother.

Mar son of Rav Ashi said: The testicles of a kid that is not yet thirty days old, are permitted without having to peel off the membrane; thereafter, if they have developed semen they are forbidden,⁷ if they have not developed semen they are permitted. How does one know this? — If there are red streaks [in the membrane], they are forbidden; I if there are no red streaks, they are permitted.

As to [dark red] meat, testicles, and the arteries [of the neck], there is a dispute between Rav Acha and Ravina. The Gemora notes: In any law of the Torah [whenever there is a dispute



⁶ This is absolutely forbidden and entails the penalty of kares.

⁷ If the membrane has not been removed because of the blood it contains.



9

between them], Ravina always adopts the lenient view and Rav Acha the strict view, and the law is always in accordance with Ravina's view thus tending towards leniency; excepting in these three cases, where Rav Acha adopts the lenient view and Ravina the strict view, and, the law is in accordance with Rav Acha's view and thus tending towards leniency. As to dark red meat, if it was cut up and salted, it is even permitted [to be cooked] in a pot; if it was thrust on a spit [and held over the fire], the blood would easily flow out; if it was placed on the coals, in this there is a dispute between Rav Acha and Ravina: one says that they [the coals] would draw out the blood, and the other says that they would cause [the meat] to contract. The same rules apply to the testicles, and also to the arteries [of the neck].

If a head was buried in hot ashes⁸ and it was made to stand up upon the open cut of the neck, the blood would then flow out and it is permitted; if it was placed upon its side, the blood would become clotted and it is forbidden; if it was made to stand up upon its nostrils and something was thrust into them,⁹ it is permitted; otherwise it is forbidden.

There are those who say: [If it was made to stand up] upon its nostrils or upon the cut of the neck, the blood would flow out; if it was placed upon its side and it was pierced with something it is permitted, otherwise it is forbidden.

[To revert to] the above text: Rav Yehudah said in the name of Shmuel: It (the thigh) consists of two sinews, the inner, next to the bone, is forbidden, and one is liable on account

of it, the outer, next to the flesh, is forbidden, but one is not liable on account of it.¹⁰

The Gemora asks: But it was taught that the inner is nearer the flesh!

Rav Acha explained in the name of Rav Kahana:, [That is so further on] where it is embedded in the flesh.

The Gemora asks: But it was taught that the outer is nearer the bone!

Rav Yehudah answered: That is so only [at the part] where the butchers cut it open.¹¹

It was stated: If a butcher was found to have overlooked forbidden fat, even only as much as a barley grain, says Rav Yehudah, [he is punishable]. Rabbi Yochanan says: [Only if he overlooked] as much as an olive's bulk.

Rav Pappa said: They do not disagree, for here it is a question of punishing him with lashes, ¹² and there of removing him. ¹³

Mar Zutra said: [If there was found] as much as a barley grain in one place or as much as an olive's bulk scattered in two or three places [he is punishable].

The law is: in order to punish him with lashes [he must have overlooked] as much as an olive's bulk, and in order to

¹³ From trading as a butcher; this is so even though he only overlooked as much as a barley grain of fat.



⁸ In order to remove the hair the more easily.

⁹ To keep the passage in the nostrils clear, so as to allow the blood to run out freely.

¹⁰ The gid hanasheh - great sciatic nerve is derived from the lumbosacral plexus and as it emerges from the pelvis; it descends first behind the hip joint and then behind the femur in the thigh. It gives off branches to the muscles behind the femur, but its longest branch is the common peroneal. The 'inner' is the great sciatic nerve, and the 'outer' the common peroneal.

 $^{^{\}rm 11}$ When they are about to 'porge' the meat; there the outer sinew is near to the bone.

¹² In that case he must have overlooked at least an olive's bulk of fat. In addition to lashes, he is barred from trading as

a butcher. 'Lashees' here is not that ordained by the Torah but corporal punishment inflicted for disobeying a Rabbinic law, i.e., Makkas Mardus, lashes for rebellion.





remove him even if [he overlooked] only as much as a barley grain.

The Mishna had stated: Butchers are not trustworthy etc.

Rabbi Chiya bar Abba said in the name of Rabbi Yochanan: Later they held that they were to be trusted.

Rav Nachman exclaimed: Have the generations become more virtuous?

The Gemora answers: At first they [the Sages] held the view of Rabbi Meir¹⁴ and so they were not to be trusted, but later they held the view of Rabbi Yehudah.¹⁵

Others report this with reference to the last clause: The sages say that they are trustworthy with regard to it as well as with regard to the [forbidden] fat.

Rabbi Chiya bar Abba said in the name of Rabbi Yochanan: Later they held that they were not to be trusted.

Rav Nachman said: Today they are to be trusted. Have the generations then become more virtuous?

The Gemora answers: At first they [the Sages] held the view of Rabbi Yehudah, and later they held the view of Rabbi Meir; and as long as people still remembered the view of Rabbi Yehudah, they were not to be trusted, but now that Rabbi Yehudah's view has been forgotten they are to be trusted.

The Mishna had stated: As well as with regard to the [forbidden] fat.

The Gemora asks: But who has mentioned the forbidden fat at all?

¹⁴ That the gid hanasheh must be removed with all its roots; and as this entailed much trouble the butchers were not be trusted for it.

The Gemora answers: This is what he [R' Meir] said: They are not trustworthy with regard to it nor with regard to the forbidden fat. But the Sages say: They are trustworthy with regard to it as well as with regard to the forbidden fat.

DAILY MASHAL

Defending People Alone

Rebbe Yoel of Satmar zt"l explained: Avraham went to pray alone for the people of Sedom, without servants or anyone else. Why? Because he wanted to defend the evil. Such a thing should be done in private, that someone unworthy should not hear and become convinced that they're really tzadikim...



¹⁵ That only the upper surface of the nerve must be removed; for this all butchers were trustworthy.