

7 Menachem Av 5774
August 3, 2014



Megillah Daf 23

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

The Mishna had stated: On a Festival, five people are called to the Torah. On Yom Kippur, six people are called to the Torah. On Shabbos, seven people are called to the Torah. We do not decrease from them, but we may add.

The Gemora cites a braisa: Rabbi Yishmael maintains that on a Festival, five people are called to the Torah. On Yom Kippur, six people are called to the Torah. On Shabbos, seven people are called to the Torah. We do not decrease nor add to them. Rabbi Akiva says: on a Festival, five people are called to the Torah. On Yom Kippur, seven people are called to the Torah. On Shabbos, six people are called to the Torah. We do not decrease from them, but we may add.

The Gemora asks: Who is the Tanna of our Mishna? It cannot be Rabbi Yishmael, for in the braisa he states that we cannot add any readers and the Mishna rules that this is permitted. It cannot be Rabbi Akiva either, because he states that we have seven readers on Yom Kippur and six on Shabbos, which is clearly inconsistent with the Mishna.

The Gemora answers: There is another braisa which cites the opinion of the school of Rabbi Yishmael and that is consistent with our Mishna, for the braisa states: The school of Rabbi Yishmael said: On a Festival, five people are called to the Torah. On Yom

Kippur, six people are called to the Torah. On Shabbos, seven people are called to the Torah. We do not decrease from them, but we may add; these are the words of Rabbi Yishmael.

The Gemora notes that it emerges that there is a Tannaic dispute regarding the opinion of Rabbi Yishmael. (23a)

The Gemora asks: Who is the author of the following braisa? On festivals people come late to synagogue and leave early. On Yom Kippur they come early and leave late. On Shabbos they come early and leave early? Shall I say it is Rabbi Akiva who makes an extra person read on Yom Kippur?

The Gemora answers: You may also say it is Rabbi Yishmael, for the order of the service of the day is extensive. (23a)

The Gemora asks: What is the significance of three, five, and seven readers?

Rabbi Yitzchak bar Nachmeini and another person with him argued about this, the other person being Rabbi Shimon ben Pazi. Some say Rabbi Shimon ben Pazi and another person with him argued about this, the other person being Rabbi Yitzchak bar Nachmeini. One says this is corresponding to the words of *Birchas*



Kohanim (in the three verses, there are three, five, and seven words respectively). One says three is based on the three gatekeepers (of a king), five is those servants who can see the king, and seven is the officers who can see the king (based on deductions from the book of Kings).

Rav Yosef taught: One says that three is based on the three gatekeepers, five is those servants who can see the king, and seven is the officers who can see the king.

Abaye asked him: Why didn't you explain this to us earlier?

Rav Yosef answered: I didn't know that you needed me to tell you. Have you ever asked me something and I refused to tell you? (23a)

Yaakov Mina'ah asked Rabbi Yehudah: What do the six of Yom Kippur represent? He replied: The six who stood at the right of Ezra and the six who stood at his left, as it says: And Ezra the scribe stood upon a tower of wood which they had made for the purpose, and beside him stood Mattisiah, Shema and Anaiah and Uriah and Chilkiah and Maaseiah, on his right hand; and on his left hand, Pedaiah, and Mishael, and Malkiyah, and Chashum and Chashbaddanah, and Zecharia Meshullam.

The Gemora asks: But these last are seven?

The Gemora answers: Zechariah is the same as Meshullam. And why is he called Meshullam? Because he was complete in his conduct.

The Gemora cites a braisa: There are no restrictions as to who can count towards the seven (to be called up to the Torah). Any Jew can be a reader even a minor and even a woman. The Chachamim decreed that a woman should not be called to the Torah because there is a concern for the pride of the congregation. (23a)

The Gemora presents a dispute whether the *maftir* (he reads a few verses in the Torah but is called primarily to read from the Prophets) can be included among the seven readers (on Shabbos). One opinion maintains that he is included because he does read from the Torah. The other opinion cites Ulla who states that the only reason the *maftir* reads initially from the Torah is out of respect for the Torah (if he would just read from the Prophets, it would seem that the Torah and Prophets are on equal footing); therefore he is not counted as being from the seven readers.

The Gemora challenges this opinion from a braisa: He who reads the haftorah from the Prophet should read not less than twenty-one verses, corresponding to those read by the seven who have read in the Torah (for they each read a minimum of three verses). Now, if it is as you say, there are twenty-four (including the maftir)?

The Gemora answers: Since it is only out of respect for the Torah that he reads, no corresponding verses to those read by him are required for the haftorah.

Rava asked: There is, he said, the haftorah of 'Add your olah offerings,' in which there are not twenty-one verses, and yet we read it!?

The Gemora answers: The case is different there, because the subject is completed (before twenty-one verses).

The Gemora asks: But where the subject is not completed, do we then not read less than twenty-one? Hasn't Rav Shmuel bar Abba said: Many times I stood before Rabbi Yochanan, and when he had read ten verses, he said, "Stop"?

The Gemora answers: In a place where there is a translator it is different, since Rav Tachlifa bar Shmuel has taught: This rule was established only for a place where there is no translator, but where there is a translator, he (the reader) may stop even earlier. (23a – 23b)

(The following Mishna teaches that the reading of the Torah and of the haftarah may not be performed if there are less than ten people present. Incidental to this, the Mishna lists other matters which require a minimum of ten people.) The Mishna states: The Shema cannot be divided if there are less than ten men present (*ten people arrived after the congregation recited Shema, one of them would recite kaddish, borchu and the blessings of Shema out loud*). A chazzan does not repeat the Shemoneh Esrei if there are less than ten men present. The Kohanim do not recite the priestly blessings if there are less than ten men present. We cannot read from the Torah or finish with a portion from the Prophets if there are less than ten men present. The standing and sitting ritual performed by a funeral, the

¹ one of the thirteen principles of Biblical hermeneutics; it links two similar words from dissimilar verses in the Torah

mourners' blessing and the consolation of the mourners should not be performed if there are less than ten men present. The wedding blessings are not recited if there are less than ten men present. We do not preface *Birchas Hamazon* (Grace after Meals) with Hashem's name if there are less than ten men present. Regarding the appraisal of consecrated land (in order to determine its value for the sake of redeeming it); ten men are required and one of them must be a kohen. The appraisal of a person has the identical halachah. (23b)

Rabbi Chiya bar Abba said in the name of Rabbi Yochanan: It is written [Vayikra 22:32]: I will be sanctified among the Children of Israel. We learn from here that all matters of sanctity must be performed with at least ten men present.

The Gemora asks: How is it illustrated in this verse that ten men are needed?

The Gemora answers: For Rabbi Chiya taught: We derive through a *gezeirah shavah*¹ using the two occurrences of the word *toch* -- among. It is written here: *I will be sanctified among the Children of Israel*, and it is written elsewhere (*by Korach*): *Separate yourselves from among this congregation*. And there are two occurrences of the word *eidah* – congregation. It is written there: *How long shall the evil congregation exist*. Just as in that case, there were ten, so too here, it refers to ten. (23b)

The Mishna had stated: The standing and sitting ritual performed by a funeral should not be performed if

there are less than ten men present. (*This is not a matter of sanctity and thus another reason is needed establishing the necessity for ten men.*) The Gemora states: The leader of the funeral procession would declare, “Stand, dear ones, stand! Sit, dear ones, sit!” (*This was part of the funeral procession, where they would sit and listen to the leader offer eulogies on the deceased.*) It would not be appropriate to grant a title of “dear ones” on an assembly which consists of less than ten men. (23b)

The Gemora asks: What is the blessing of mourners?

The Gemora answers: It is the blessing recited in the street, since Rabbi Yitzchak said in the name of Rabbi Yochanan: The blessing of mourners requires the presence of ten, the mourners not being counted; the wedding blessings require the presence of ten, the groom being counted. (23b)

The Mishna had stated: We do not preface *Birchas Hamazon* (Grace after Meals) with Hashem’s name if there are less than ten men present.

The Gemora explains: Since the one who invites has to say, “Let us bless our God,” it is not proper to do so with less than ten.

The Mishna had stated: Regarding the appraisal of consecrated land (in order to determine its value for the sake of redeeming it); ten men are required and one of them must be a kohen.

The Gemora asks: From where is this rule derived?

Shmuel explains that the section in the Torah

discussing consecration mentions an appraising *Kohen* ten times. Each mention of a *Kohen* is an exclusion of a non-*Kohen*. All but the first mention are therefore redundant exclusions, which become inclusions of non-*Kohen* appraisers.

The *Gemora* challenges this reasoning, since after changing a redundant exclusion into an inclusion, the next exclusion is necessary. Therefore, we should consider each pair to be one exclusion followed by a redundant inclusion, leaving five *Kohanim* and five non *Kohanim*. The *Gemora* leaves this as an unresolved difficulty. (23b)

The *Mishna* said that a person is equivalent to real estate. Although a person cannot be consecrated, Rabbi Avahu explains that the *Mishna* is referring to one who consecrated his market value.

The *braisa* explains that such a person must pay his market value as if he was sold as a slave. Since a slave is equated to real estate in judicial matters, this market value must be appraised by ten, just like real estate. (23b)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

MAY A CHILD OR WOMAN RECEIVE AN ALIYAH?

Kollel Iyun Hadaf discusses the halachic implications of our Gemora.

(a) Gemara

1. Beraisa: All count towards the seven, even a child or woman, but Chachamim said that a woman should not read for it is dishonorable to the Tzibur.

2. 24a - Mishnah: A child may read the Torah and translate.

(b) Rishonim

1. Rif and Rosh (3:5) bring the Beraisa and Mishnah.

i. Ran (DH ha'Kol): A child or woman may complete the seven, but all seven (Ran 15a Sof DH Masnisin - the majority) may not be children or women. When only the first and last Olim bless, these Aliyos must be given to men, for men cannot be Yotzei with the Berachah of a child or woman. Nowadays, everyone blesses, so a child or woman may read first or last.

2. Rosh (Kidushin 1:49): R. Tam says that a woman may bless on a Mitzvah from which she is exempt. R. Yitzchak bar Yehudah proves this from the Heter for women to read the Torah. R. Tam rejects the proof, for even if the Olah already blessed for his Mitzvah of Talmud Torah, he blesses again for Kri'as ha'Torah (i.e. the Berachah is to honor the Kri'ah). Also, perhaps the Heter for a woman to read was when only the first and last Olim used to bless, and she would be Olah in the middle (and not bless).

3. Rambam (Hilchos Tefilah 12:17): A woman should not read b'Tzibur for it is dishonorable to the Tzibur. If a child knows how to read and knows Whom we bless, he counts towards the number that must read.

i. Source (Hagahos Maimoniyos 70): In the Yerushalmi, Amora'im argue about whether a child must know how to bless or Whom we bless in order to count towards the seven on Shabbos. Likewise, when three read a child may complete the count.

4. Pirush ha'Mishnayos (24a): A Ga'on says that a child may read only after three have read.

(c) Poskim

1. Shulchan Aruch (OC 282:3): All count towards the seven, even a child or woman, but Chachamim said that a woman should not read for it is dishonorable to the Tzibur.

i. Beis Yosef (DH v'Chosav ha'Rav): The Avudraham says that in a city of all Kohanim a Kohen reads the first two Aliyos, and children and women read the rest. The Roke'ach does not allow a child to be one of the three, but he may be one of seven, i.e. after three have read.

ii. Note: In Sof Siman 135 (DH Kosav ha'Roke'ach), the Beis Yosef says that the Roke'ach allows a child to have an additional Aliyah (which is forbidden when three read), but not an obligatory Aliyah.

iii. Prishah (3): The Tur holds like the Rambam who forbids women to bless on Mitzvos from which they are exempt. Therefore, a woman or child may not receive an Aliyah nowadays, when every Oleh blesses.

iv. Question: It is the practice to allow children to receive Maftir!

v. Answer #1 Prishah (3): The initial enactment was to allow children to receive Maftir. If so, it was enacted that they may bless for Kavod ha'Torah.

vi. Answer #2 (Birkei Yosef 7, brought in Kaf ha'Chayim 25): A child may receive an Aliyah nowadays, for Talmud Torah applies to him, and others are commanded to teach him.

vii. Erech Lechem (135:13): The Rambam says that a child counts towards the number that must read, i.e. even when three read.

viii. Mishnah Berurah (11): A child may read only when seven read, but not when three, four, five or six

read.

ix. Mishnah Berurah (12): Some say that if the only Kohen is a child we call him (to read). However, the Magen Avraham (6) learns from "V'Kidashto Ki Es Lechem Elokecha Hu Makriv" that we are commanded to honor only adult Kohanim, for only they do Avodah. Therefore, a Yisrael reads instead. Nowadays the custom is to call children only for Maftir, even after seven have read.

x. Mishnah Berurah (13): A child may not read out loud from the Torah to be Motzi the Tzibur until he brings two hairs. We rely on the Chazakah that a 13 year old brought two hairs. If there is no adult who can read it is better that a child read than to Mevatel Kri'as ha'Torah.

2. Rema: They can join to be part of the seven, but all may not be children or women.

i. Source (Gra DH v'Elu): The Mishnah says that a *child or woman* (singular) counts, i.e. only one. The Poskim's text reads 'All can complete the count...'

ii. Mishnah Berurah (14): 'All', i.e. the majority, may not be children or women.

iii. Note: The Mishnah Berurah explains the Rema. Above, the Mishnah Berurah said that our custom is to call a child only for Maftir.

3. Rema: A Kena'ani slave is like a woman; if his mother is a Yisraelis he may read.

i. Hagahos Maimoniyos (60): If his mother is a Yisraelis he is permitted (like a regular Yisrael), because the child of a slave or Nochri with a Yisraelis is Kosher.

ii. Note: Even though the Rema cites Hagahos Maimoniyos, it seems that he argues. Hagahos Maimoniyos connotes that if the child of a slave or Nochri from a Yisraelis would be a Mamzer, he could

not read. The Rema explicitly permits a Mamzer to read!

DAILY MASHAL

By: Reb Binyomin Adler

The Gemara states that we learn that all matters of sanctity require ten adult men from the verse that states (Vayikra 22:32) וְנִקְדְּשִׁיתִי בְּתוֹךְ בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל, I should be sanctified among the Children of Israel. We then apply a gezeirah shavah as the word תּוֹךְ appears in this verse, and it is said regarding Korach and his entourage (Bamidbar 16:21) הַבְּדִלּוּ מִתּוֹךְ הָעֵדָה הַזֹּאת, separate yourselves from amid this assembly. We then apply another gezeirah shavah as in the verse just mentioned there is the word עֵדָה and it is said regarding the ten spies (Ibid 14:27) עַד מָתִי לְעֵדָה הַרְעָה הַזֹּאת, "how long for this evil assembly." Just like regarding the spies there were ten, so too regarding Korach the words מִתּוֹךְ הָעֵדָה refers to ten men. We can then prove that the word בְּתוֹךְ said regarding sanctifying HaShem's Name refers to ten men.

One must wonder why the Gemara derives the requirement of sanctifying HaShem's Name with ten men from verses that refer to wicked people, such as Korach and his entourage and the ten wicked spies? The answer to this question can be found in Rashi (Shemos 14:4, citing Mechilta) who writes that when HaShem takes vengeance against the wicked, His Name becomes magnified and glorified. If one were to think that HaShem's Name is sanctified amongst the wicked to a lesser degree than amongst the righteous, Rashi elsewhere (Vayikra 10:3) informs us that the opposite is true. Rashi writes that when



HaShem metes out justice to the righteous, He becomes feared, elevated and praised, and if that is the case with the righteous, then certainly with the wicked.

We can now understand why the Gemara here specifically cites the verses regarding the wicked, as it is precisely through the punishment of the wicked that HaShem's Name becomes glorified.