

14 Mar-Cheshvan 5782
Oct. 20, 2021



Rosh Hashanah Daf 11

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

TISHREI OR NISSAN?

The Gemara cites a Baraisa: Rabbi Eliezer said: The world was created in Tishrei. The Patriarchs (Avrohom and Yaakov) were born in Tishrei. The Patriarchs died in Tishrei. Yitzchak, however, was born on Pesach. On Rosh Hashanah - Sarah, Rochel and Chanah were remembered (by Hashem and it was decreed that they would give birth to children). Yosef was released from prison on Rosh Hashanah. Our forefathers were removed from servitude in Egypt on Rosh Hashanah. They were redeemed from Egypt in the month of Nissan and the final redemption will be in Tishrei.

Rabbi Yehoshua maintains that the world was created in Nissan. The Patriarchs were born in Nissan. The Patriarchs died in Nissan. Yitzchok was born on Pesach. On Rosh Hashanah - Sarah, Rochel and Chanah were remembered (by Hashem and it was decreed that they would give birth to children). Yosef was released from prison on Rosh Hashanah. Our forefathers were removed from servitude in Egypt on Rosh Hashanah. They were redeemed from Egypt in the month of Nissan and the final redemption will be in Nissan. (10b3 – 11a1)

It has been taught in a *Baraisa*: Rabbi Eliezer says: From where do we know that the world was created in Tishrei? It is because it is written: And God said, Let the earth be covered with vegetation, herbage yielding seed, and fruit trees. [This seems to indicate that at the time of Creation, vegetation and fruit were already there.] Which is the month in which the earth is covered with vegetation and

the trees are full of fruit? You must say that this is Tishrei. That time was the season of rainfall, and the rain came down and the plants came forth, as it is written: And a mist went up from the earth (and watered the entire surface of the soil). (11a1 – 11a2)

Rabbi Yehoshua says: From where do we know that the world was created in Nissan? It is because it is written: And the earth brought forth vegetation, herbage yielding seed after its kind, and tree bearing fruit. [This seems to indicate that at the time of Creation, vegetation and fruit were just beginning to sprout.] Which is the month in which the earth brings forth vegetation and trees begin to produce fruit? You must say that this is Nissan. That time was the period when domesticated animals, wild animals and birds copulate with one another, as it is written: The sheep of the flock become pregnant.

The *Gemora* asks: And how does the other explain the verse: tree bearing fruit?

The *Gemora* answers: This signifies a blessing for future generations (that the trees will always produce fruit).

The *Gemora* asks: And what does the other make of the words fruit trees?

The *Gemora* answers: This is to be explained in accordance with that which Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said, for Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: All creatures of the creation were brought into being with their full stature, their full capacities, and their full beauty, as it says: And the



heavens and the earth were finished, and all the host of them [tzeva'am]. Read not tzeva'am, but tzivyonam [their desire].¹ (11a1 – 11a2)

Rabbi Eliezer said: From where do we know that the Patriarchs were born in Tishrei? It is because it is written: And all the men of Israel assembled themselves to King Solomon, in the month of Eisanim at the Festival; that is, the month in which the mighty ones [eisanim] of the world were born. – How do we know that eisanim means mighty? — Because it is written: Your dwelling-place is firm [eisan], and it also says: Hear you mountains, the grievance of Hashem, and you mighty ones [eisanim], the foundations of the earth. It also says: The voice of my beloved, behold it comes, skipping over the mountains, leaping over the hills, [where] 'skipping over the mountains' means, for the merit of the patriarchs, and 'leaping over the hills' means, for the merit of the matriarchs.

Rabbi Yehoshua said: From where do we know that the Patriarchs were born in Nissan? It is because it is written: And it came to pass in the four hundred and eightieth year after the children of Israel came out of the land of Egypt, in the fourth year in the month of Ziv (radiance); that is, the month in which the radiant ones of the world were born.

The *Gemora* asks: But how does he explain the expression 'month of Eisanim'?

The *Gemora* answers: It refers to the month which is mighty in mitzvos (for it contains the mitzvah of shofar,

¹ Hashem at Creation created everything in their full maturity, according to their will and according to their desire. (All creatures were notified that they would be created and they accepted. They were able to choose the forms that they preferred.)

fasting on Yom Kippur, lulav, aravah and the water libations).

The *Gemora* asks: What does the other make of the expression 'in the month of Ziv'?

The *Gemora* answers: It means, the month in which there is radiance for the trees, for so Rav Yehudah has said: When a man goes abroad in the days of Nissan and sees trees blossoming, he should say, 'Blessed is He that has not left His world short of anything and has created in it goodly creatures and goodly trees to rejoice mankind'. (11a2 – 11a3)

The *Gemora* cites Scriptural verses proving the birth month of the Patriarchs. He who holds that they were born in Nissan holds that they died in Nissan, and he who holds that they were born in Tishrei holds that they died in Tishrei, as it says: I am a hundred and twenty years old this day. The word 'this day' seems here superfluous. What then is the point of it? [As much as to say], This day my days and years have reached full measure, which teaches that the Holy One, blessed be He, sits and completes the years of the righteous from day to day and from month to month, as it says: The number of your days I will fulfill.² (11a3 – 11a4)

How do we know that Yitzchok was born on Pesach? As it is written: [Hashem told Avrohom] "At the festival I will return to you... and Sarah will have a son." Now when was it [the prophecy] said? Shall I say [he was speaking] on Pesach and referring to Shavuos? Could she bear in fifty days? Shall I say then that [he was speaking on] Shavuos and was referring to Tishrei? Even in five months could she

² Rabbi Eliezer and Rabbi Yehoshua agree that they died in the same month in which they were born. This is derived from a possuk regarding Moshe Rabbeinu which teaches us that Hashem guarantees the righteous that their years will be full. This means that they will die on the same month and day in which they were born.

bear? I must suppose then that he was speaking on Sukkos and referring to Pesach. Even so, could she bear in six months? — It has been taught that that year was a leap year. All the same, if the Master deducts the days of tumah, the time is too short? — Mar Zutra replied: Even those who hold that when a woman bears at nine months she does not give birth before the month is complete admit that if she bears at seven months she can give birth before the month is complete, as it says: And it came to pass after the cycle of days; the minimum of cycles is two, and the minimum of days is two. (11a4)

‘On Rosh Hashanah Sarah, Rachel and Chanah were remembered. From where do we know this? — Rabbi Eliezer said: We learn it from a gezeirah shavah using the words ‘pekidah,’ ‘pekidah,’ and ‘zechirah,’ ‘zechirah.’ It is written concerning Rachel: And God remembered Rachel, and it is written concerning Chanah: And Hashem remembered her, and we can derive the time through a gezeirah shavah of ‘zechirah,’ ‘zechirah’ (remembrance) in connection with Rosh hashanah, as it is written: A rest day, a remembrance of the sounding of the shofar. The gezeirah shavah of ‘pekidah,’ ‘pekidah’ [is as follows]: It is written concerning Chanah: For Hashem remembered Chanah, and it is written concerning Sarah: And Hashem remembered Sarah. (11a5)

‘On Rosh Hashanah Yosef went forth from the prison’. From where do we know this? — Because it is written: Blow a shofar at the moon’s renewal, when the moon is covered on our festival. Because it is a statute for Israel, etc. He appointed it for Yosef for a testimony when he went forth etc. (11a5 – 11b1)

‘On Rosh Hashanah the bondage of our ancestors ceased in Egypt’. It is written in one place: and I will bring you out from under the burdens of the Egyptians, and it is written in another place: I removed his shoulder from the burden. (11b1)

‘In Nissan they were redeemed’, as Scripture recounts. (11b1)

‘In Tishrei they will be redeemed in time to come’. This is learned with a gezeirah shavah using the words ‘shofar,’ ‘shofar.’ It is written in one place: Blow a shofar at the moon’s renewal, and it is written in another place: On that day a great shofar shall be blown. (11b1)

‘Rabbi Yehoshua says: In Nissan they were redeemed, in Nissan they will be redeemed in the time to come’. From where do we know this? — Scripture calls [Pesach] ‘a night of watchings’, [which means], a night which has been continuously watched for from the six days of the creation. What does the other say to this? — [He says it means], a night which is under constant protection against evil spirits. (11b1)

The Gemora shows how the argument between Rabbi Eliezer and Rabbi Yehoshua pertaining to which month the world was created in is the foundation for a different argument between them. For it was taught in a Baraisa: In the six hundredth year of the life of Noach, in the second month, on the seventeenth day of the month. Rabbi Yehoshua says: that day was the seventeenth of Iyar, a day on which the constellation Kimah (a small constellation which can be found in the tail of the Lamb) sets during the daytime. Even though this happened in the early summer, a time where the bottomless springs become used up (and there is no rain to refill them); since the people of that generation were corrupted, the Holy One, Blessed be He changed the normal nature of Creation and brought the constellation Kimah up during the daytime. He took two stars from it and brought the Flood to the world.

Rabbi Eliezer said: that day was the seventeenth of Mar-Cheshvan, a day on which the constellation Kimah rises during the daytime, a time where the bottomless springs increase due to the rain; since the people of that



generation were corrupted, the Holy One, Blessed be He changed the normal nature of Creation and brought the constellation Kimah up during the daytime. He took two stars from it and brought the Flood to the world.³

Now accepting the view of Rabbi Yehoshua, we can understand why the word 'second' is used; but on Rabbi Eliezer's view, what is meant by 'second'? — [It means], the second to [the day of] judgment. Again, on Rabbi Yehoshua's view we see what change there was in the work of creation; but on Rabbi Eliezer's view what change was there? — The answer is found in the dictum of Rav Chisda; for Rav Chisda said: With hot liquid they sinned and with hot liquid they were punished. 'With hot liquid they sinned', namely, in immorality. 'With hot liquid they were punished': it is written here: and the waters subsided, and it is written elsewhere: and the wrath of the king cooled down. (11b1 – 12a2)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

WHY IS ROSH HASHANAH IN TISHREI ACCORDING TO RABBI YEHOShUA?

The Gemora brings a dispute between Rabbi Yehoshua and Rabbi Eliezer if the world was created in Nissan or in Tishrei. The Ran cites a Mishna on daf 16a that on Rosh Hashanah the entire world pass in front of Hashem and get judged. The Ran asks that this makes sense according to Rabbi Eliezer that the world was created in Tishrei and that is why this is the day that the world is judged on but why was this day chosen according to Rabbi Yehoshua who maintains that the world was created in Nissan. He answers that Hashem with His infinite compassion wanted Klal Yisroel to be judged favorably and therefore He chose

³ The above argument is based on their respective viewpoints regarding the month in which the world was created. Rabbi Eliezer, who holds that the world was created in Tishrei, holds

the first of Tishrei to judge them which is a time that is designated for forgiveness and atonement.

Aruch Lener cites Tosfos on 27a that quotes from Rabbi Elozar Hakalir who established a prayer that has the opinion of Rabbi Eliezer and Rabbi Yehoshua in it and he explains because both viewpoints are the words of Hashem. He further explains that Hashem's will was to create the world in Tishrei however it wasn't actually created until Nissan. Since there is a principle that a thought is like an action, the Day of Judgment is Tishrei even according to Rabbi Yehoshua.

AVROHOM'S BRIS

Tosfos cites a Pirkei D'Rabbi Eliezer that the bris milah of Avrohom occurred on Yom Kippur.

A question is asked that since the bris of Avrohom did not take place on the eighth day, it should be considered a "shelo b'zmano" – a bris that is not in its proper time. The halacha is that only a bris which is done in the correct time can override Shabbos or Yom Kippur. How could he have done the bris on Yom Kippur?

In the sefer Yehuda Yaaleh (Y"D 253) it is written that since Avrohom wasn't commanded to have a bris until now, it was regarded as a bris in its proper time and therefore the obligation will override Yom Kippur.

DAILY MASHAL

The Connection to Rosh Hashanah

On the first day of Rosh HaShanah, the Torah reading comes from Parshas Vayeira. It begins with the conception

that the Flood began in Mar-Cheshvan and Rabbi Yehoshua, who maintains that the world was created in Nissan, maintains that the Flood began in Iyar.

and birth of Yitzchak to Avraham and Sarah after many years of barrenness. This is a fitting section to be read on this day as the gemara (Rosh HaShanah 10b) teaches us that it was on Rosh HaShanah that Sarah, Rachel and Chanah were "remembered" and their prayers answered. Then ensuing episodes of Yitzchak's weaning and the expulsion of Hagar and Yishmael are all directly pertinent to Yitzchak's upbringing and are justly included in the reading. The last two aliyos deal with the pact made between Avimelech, king of the Pelishtim, and Avraham that they and their descendants shall do no harm to each other. On the surface, there does not seem to be any relevance to Rosh HaShanah. The first three aliyos contain 21 pesukim, conceivably enough to comprise a complete Torah reading, even on Shabbos when we require seven aliyos. Why, then, is this section included in the reading?

I suggest that this section of the reading does in fact have a significant connection to the Rosh HaShanah experience. The central theme of the Mussaf service on Rosh HaShanah is the trio of malchios, zichronos and shofaros - kingship, remembrances and shofars. The middle of the three, remembrances, refers specifically to recalling the various covenants made with our forefathers. This section which is read at the end of the day's Torah reading impresses upon us the significance of a covenant. The pact made between Avimelech and Avraham, later reaffirmed by Yitzchak, was binding over many generations. Despite being gravely mistreated and persecuted by the Pelishtim, Avimelech's descendants, after entering Eretz Yisroel, on two occasions (Yeshoshua 15:63, Shmuel II 5) B'nei Yisroel refrained from any offensive against the Pelishtim. In the Midrash (Sifrei Re'eih 12:17) R' Yehoshua ben Levi teaches that it was within their powers to do battle with them, but they were not allowed because of the covenant between Avraham and Avimelech.

Perhaps, the inclusion of this episode in the Torah reading is in parallel with the zichronos aspect of our prayers. Indeed, we are guilty many times over of violating our

covenant with HaShem to keep the Torah in its entirety. Nevertheless, we beseech of HaShem to remember, so to speak, the covenant made with Avraham, Yitzchak and Yaakov never to forsake us despite our transgressions, in the same manner in which we faithfully upheld our accord with the Pelishtim.