

14 Elul 5781
August 22, 2021



Sukkah Daf 46

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Whenever a man puts on his tefillin he must recite the blessing; these are the words of Rebbe, but the Sages ruled: He recites the blessing in the morning only. It was stated: Abaye ruled: The law is in agreement with Rebbe, while Rava ruled: The law is in agreement with the Sages. Rav Mari the son of Shmuel's daughter remarked: I noticed that Rava himself did not act in accordance with his own ruling, but rising early, he would go to the latrine, emerge and wash his hands, put on his tefillin and recite the blessing, and when he needed to use the latrine a second time he would go, emerge and wash his hands, put on his tefillin and recite the blessing again. We also act in accordance with the ruling of Rebbe and recite the blessing¹ all seven days.

Mar Zutra remarked: I notice that Rav Pappi recited the blessing whenever he put on his tefillin. The Rabbis of the school of Rav Ashi recited the blessing whenever they touched their tefillin. (46a1 – 46a2)

Rav Yehudah citing Shmuel ruled: The mitzvah of lulav² applies to all the seven days, but Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi ruled: The mitzvah of the lulav applies to the first day only, and subsequently it is but an ordinance of the Elders; while Rabbi Yitzchak ruled: [The taking of the lulav on] every day, and even on the first one is but an ordinance of the Elders. But have we not an established rule that on the first day it is a Biblical mitzvah? — Say rather: Except on the first day. - But if so, isn't this identical with the ruling

of Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi? — Read: And so said Rabbi Yitzchak.

Rav also is of the opinion that the mitzvah of the lulav applies to all seven days, for Rabbi Chiya bar Ashi citing Rav stated: One who kindles the Chanukah lamp must recite a blessing.³ Rabbi Yirmiyah ruled: He who sees the Chanukah light⁴ must recite the blessing. What blessing does one recite? — Rav Yehudah answered: On the first day he who kindles the light must recite three blessings and he who sees it must recite two; from then on, he who kindles the lights recites two blessings and he who sees them only one. What is the blessing? — 'Blessed [are You, Hashem our God, King of the Universe] Who ha sanctified us with His commandments, and commanded us to kindle the light of Chanukah'. But where did He command us? — [The mitzvah is deduced from the verse:] You shall not turn aside. Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak said: [Deduction is made from the verse:] Ask your father, and he will relate it to you. (Which [blessing] does one omit? — The blessing on the season. Might it not be suggested that one omits the blessing of the miracle? — The miracle occurred every day).

Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak taught this explicitly: Rav ruled: The mitzvah of the lulav applies to all seven days. (46a2 – 46a3)

¹ On the Sukkah.

² The recital of the blessing over it.

³ Even though it is only a Rabbinical institution; and similarly in the case of lulav.

⁴ While he himself did not light one in his own home.

Our Rabbis taught in a Baraisa (cited above): He who makes a sukkah for himself recites: ‘Blessed are You, Hashem . . . who has kept us in life ...’. When he enters to sit in it he recites: ‘Blessed [are You] ... who has sanctified us ...’. If it was already erected, he may recite the blessing if he can add something new to it; and if not, he recites two blessings when he enters to sit in it.

Rav Ashi said: I observed that Rav Kahana recited all of them over the Kiddush cup.

Our Rabbis taught in a Baraisa: He who has to perform many mitzvos [simultaneously] shall say: ‘Blessed . . . Who has sanctified us with His commandments and commanded us concerning the mitzvos’. Rabbi Yehudah said: One must recite a blessing over each one separately. Rabbi Zeira, or, as some say, Rabbi Chanina bar Pappa said: The halachah is in agreement with Rabbi Yehudah. Rabbi Zeira, or, as some say, Rabbi Chanina bar Pappa further stated: What is the reason of Rabbi Yehudah? Because it is written: Blessed is Hashem day by day. Now do we bless Him by day and not by night? But this comes to teach you: Give Him every day its appropriate blessings. So here as well: Give Him for every single thing, its appropriate blessings.

Rabbi Zeira, or, as some say, Rabbi Chanina bar Pappa further stated: Come and see how the character of the Holy One, Blessed be He, differs from that of flesh and blood. One of flesh and blood can put something into an empty vessel but not into a full one. But the Holy One, Blessed be He, is not so; He puts more (spirituality) into a full vessel (*one who is filled with Torah knowledge*), but

⁵ To be eaten.

⁶ Even after it has been used for the mitzvah.

⁷ To be used as wood for a fire.

⁸ The moment, therefore, it has served its mitzvah purpose for the last time on the seventh day, mundane use may be made of it.

not into an empty one, for it is written: *If listening you will listen*, implying that if you listen at first (*when you are young*), you will go on listening (*even later*), and if not (*that you will not listen when you are young*), you will not listen later as well. Another explanation is: If you listen to the old (*you review that which you have learned*) you will listen to the new (*by understanding new things in what you are learning*), but if your heart turns away (*and you do not review*), you will not listen any more (*for you will not have the chance to learn later*). (46a4 – 46b1)

The Mishnah had stated: From the hands of the children, etc. Rabbi Yochanan said: The esrog is forbidden⁵ on the seventh day,⁶ and permitted on the eighth; the Sukkah is forbidden⁷ even on the eighth. Rish Lakish, however, ruled that the esrog is permitted even on the seventh day. On what principle do they differ? — One Master is of the opinion that it is set aside only for the performance of its mitzvah,⁸ while the other Master is of the opinion that it is set aside for the whole day.

Rish Lakish raised an objection against Rabbi Yochanan: They (the adults) used to grab (on the seventh day) lulavim from the hands of the children and eat their esrogim. Doesn’t this equally apply to adults⁹ also? — No; it applies to children alone.¹⁰ There are others who say that Rabbi Yochanan raised the objection against Rish Lakish: They (the adults) used to grab (on the seventh day) lulavim from the hands of the children and eat their esrogim. [Of] children only, but not [of] adults! — No; the same law applies to [those of] adults also, and the reason that he mentions children is that he states what was customary.¹¹

⁹ That the adults may eat their own esrogim as well, which proves that an esrog may be eaten on the seventh day.

¹⁰ Since their esrogim were never properly set aside, as is the case with adults, for the mitzvah. A child is under no obligation to have an esrog, and he is given one for the mere purpose of his religious training and practice.

¹¹ The esrogim were grabbed from the children, not from adults.

Rav Pappa said to Abaye: What, according to Rabbi Yochanan, is the essential difference between the Sukkah and the esrog?¹² — The other answered him: The Sukkah which is fit to be used [for its mitzvah] at twilight [after the seventh day], for if there would be a need to have a meal at that time he would be required to sit in it and eat there, is set aside for its mitzvah purpose during the twilight, and since it is set aside during twilight, it is also set aside for the whole of the eighth day; the esrog, however, which is not suitable during twilight,¹³ is not set aside for its mitzvah purpose during twilight, hence it is not set aside for the purpose for the whole of the eighth day. Levi,¹⁴ however, ruled: The esrog is forbidden even on the eighth day;¹⁵ while the father of Shmuel ruled: The esrog is forbidden on the seventh day, but permitted on the eighth. — The father of Shmuel subsequently adopted the view of Levi. Rabbi Zeira, however, adopted the [earlier] view of the father of Shmuel, for Rabbi Zeira said: It is forbidden to eat an esrog [even one] that has become invalid, all the seven days. (46b1 – 46b2)

Rabbi Zeira said: One should not transfer possession of the hoshana (the lulav bundle) to a child on the first day of Sukkos.¹⁶ What is the reason? — Because a child is entitled to acquire possession but not to transfer it, and the result will be that the man would be discharging his mitzvah with a lulav which is not his.¹⁷

Rabbi Zeira further said: One should not promise a child to give him something and then not give it to him, because

¹² That the former should be forbidden on the eighth day while the latter is permitted.

¹³ After one has taken it for the mitzvah in the morning.

¹⁴ Since it is doubtful whether the moment of twilight is to be regarded as the conclusion of the one day or as the beginning of the following one, and since the esrog was forbidden all the seventh day including twilight which possibly belongs to the eighth day.

¹⁵ Because what is forbidden at twilight remains forbidden throughout the day.

he will thereby teach him to lie, as it is stated: They have taught their tongues to speak lies. (46b2 – 46b3)

[The following dispute is based on the same principles] as the one between Rabbi Yochanan and Rish Lakish. For it was stated: One who designated seven esrogim, one for each of the seven days of Sukkos, Rav maintains that he is permitted to eat the esrog after discharging his obligation, whereas Rav Assi maintains that one can only eat the esrog on the following day. On what principle do they differ? One Master is of the opinion that it is set aside only for the performance of its mitzvah, while the other Master is of the opinion that it is set aside for the whole day.

And as for us,¹⁸ who keep two days [of Sukkos] how are we to proceed? — Abaye replied: On the eighth day which may be the seventh, it¹⁹ is forbidden; on the ninth day which may be the eighth, it is permitted. Mereimar ruled: Even on the eighth day, which may be the seventh, it is permitted. In Sura they acted in accordance with the ruling of Mereimar. Rav Shisha the son of Rav Idi acted in accordance with the ruling of Abaye. And the law is in agreement with Abaye. (46b3)

Rav Yehudah the son of Rav Shmuel bar Shilas citing Rav said: The eighth day which may be the seventh is regarded as the seventh in respect of the Sukkah and as the eighth in respect of the blessing.²⁰ Rabbi Yochanan, however, said: It is regarded as the eighth in respect of both. That one must dwell [in the Sukkah on the eighth day] is agreed by all, they only differ on the question of the blessing.

¹⁶ Unless he himself has already performed the mitzvah with it.

¹⁷ Which is invalid. Once the man gave it to the child, it becomes the latter's property which, as a minor, he cannot transfer again to him.

¹⁸ Since we are in doubt as to which day is the first.

¹⁹ The esrog.

²⁰ One should make mention of Shemini Atzeres in Shemoneh Esrei, Bircas haMazon and Kiddush.



According to the one who regards the day as the seventh in respect of the Sukkah, we also recite the blessing [of the Sukkah], while according to the one who holds that it is regarded as the eighth in respect of both, we do not recite the blessing [of the Sukkah]. Rav Yosef observed: Take the ruling of Rabbi Yochanan in your hand, since Rav Huna bar Bizna and all the great men of the generation entered a Sukkah on the eighth day which may have been the seventh, and while they sat in it, they did not recite the blessing. But is it not possible that they were of the same opinion as he who laid down that once a man has recited the blessing on the first day, he has no more need to recite it? — There was a tradition that they had just come from the meadow.²¹ (46b3 – 47a1)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

Teaching not to Lie

The Gemara states that one should not promise something to a child and then not give it to him, because it will teach the child to lie. The obvious question here is, why are we concerned about teaching a child to lie in the future, yet we are not concerned that the person himself is guilty of lying.

Perhaps we can suggest that the Gemara is aware of this issue and the Gemara is revealing to us that besides the lie being told by the individual himself, there are further repercussions as the child will learn how to lie.

In one of the *Hagados Shel Pesach*, it is recorded that when his children grew older, Reb Yaakov Kaminetsky zt"l ceased performing the ceremony of having a child return the *afikomen* in exchange for a gift, because Reb Yaakov realized that as the children grew in age, their requests also became more extravagant. Reb Yaakov saw that it would not always be possible to fulfill their requests, so he

²¹ And they had not dwelled in the sukkah at all on that Festival.

chose to stop the ceremony outright, rather than issue promises that he could not adhere to.

DAILY MASHAL

Review and Gain New Insights

The Gemara states that if one listens to the old by constantly reviewing what he has studied, he will be able to gain new insight into what he has previously learned. If, however, one abandons his learning by not reviewing his studies, then he will not be able to gain new insight into what he has studied. The Gemara states that Torah study is akin to fish in the sea, who always ascend to the surface to drink in the new drops of rain, despite the fact that the fish are surrounded by water at all times. Torah study is not a subject where one can assimilate information from a text and then carry on with life.

The Gemara in Kiddushin 30a teaches us that the mitzvah of Torah study, derived from the words *vishinantam levonecho*, you shall teach them thoroughly to your children, necessitates that one constantly delve deeper into Torah. The word *vishinantam* can also imply review, as the root word is *shoneh*, which means reputation. One must constantly review his studies, and only then can he be assured that he will gain new insight into Torah.