

15 Elul 5781  
August 23, 2021



Sukkah Daf 47

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

**Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h**

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Some say that both Rav and Rabbi Yochanan agree that one doesn't recite a blessing on sitting in the sukkah, and their dispute is whether one must dwell in the sukkah. According to the one who ruled that it is regarded as the seventh day in respect of the Sukkah, we must indeed sit in it, while according to the one who ruled that it is regarded as the eighth day in respect of both, we may not even sit in it. Rav Yosef said: Take the ruling of Rabbi Yochanan in your hand, for who is the source of teaching of Rav? It is Rav Yehudah, the son of Rav Shmuel bar Shilas, and he himself dwelled outside the sukkah on the eighth day that was possibly the seventh. The Gemora rules that we sit in the sukkah [on the eighth day that was possibly the seventh], but we do not recite a blessing. (47a1)

Rabbi Yochanan says: One says Shehecheyanu on the eighth day of Sukkos, but not on the seventh day of Pesach. Rabbi Levi bar Chama, or Rabbi Chama bar Chanina, said: Proof to this is from the fact that the eighth day of Sukkos [Shemini Atzeres] is different than the preceding days in three ways: Sukkah (we don't sit in the sukkah), lulav (we don't take the lulav), and the

<sup>1</sup> The next three statements point out that in the section dealing with the sacrifices of the festival, there are differences between the first seven days, and the Eighth Day either in respect of the laws of the sacrifices or the expressions used in connection with them; proving that the latter is a separate festival. These differences are that (a) on each of the seven days a number of bullocks were sacrificed while on the Eighth Day only one was offered. (b) the descriptions of the sacrifices of the second to the seventh day begin with the word 'and' ('And on the day'),

water libation (we don't do water libation). And even according to Rabbi Yehudah, who says that water libation was done for all eight days, it is different in the first two ways. – If so, the seventh day of Pesach is also different, in that there is no obligation to eat matzah, for a master said: The first night of Pesach is mandatory, from then onward, it is voluntary. – Now, is this a comparison? The seventh day of Pesach is different than the first night, but not different than the first day (as there is no obligation to eat matzah then); the eighth of Sukkos, however, is different than the first day as well (in these three, or two ways). Ravina said: This eighth day is different from the day preceding it, while this (the seventh day of Pesach) is different only from the day which is prior to the days that precede it.

Rav Pappa said:<sup>1</sup> Here (Shemini Atzeres) it is written: *a bull*; whereas there (on the other days of Sukkos), it is written: *bulls*.<sup>2</sup>

Rav Nachman bar Yitzchak said: The sacrifice of the eighth day is introduced by *bayom* – *on the day* (indicating that it is a new section of time). The

suggesting continuity, while that of the Eighth Day commences 'On the eighth day' omitting the 'and', (c) on the seventh day it was 'According to their ordinance', connecting it with the previous days whereas the Eighth Day has, 'according to the ordinance'.

<sup>2</sup> The sacrifices of the first seven days of Sukkos include multiple bulls (in descending order), while the eighth day includes only one bull.

sacrifices of the first seven days of Sukkos are introduced by *ubayom* – **and on the day** (connecting each day to the one preceding it).

Rav Ashi said: The eighth day it is written: *kamisphat* – *like the rule* (referring to it alone), whereas regarding the sacrifice of the seventh day it is written: *kemisphatam* – *like their rules* (referring to all the preceding days together).

The Gemora suggests a support for Rabbi Yochanan from the following Baraisa: The bulls, rams, and sheep of Sukkos are essential to one another (and if one of the animals are missing, the rest may not be offered). Rabbi Yehudah says: The bulls are not essential to one another, as they diminish in number from one day to the next.<sup>3</sup> The Sages said to him: They [all should be independent, as they] all diminish on the eighth day!? Rabbi Yehudah said to them: The eighth day is its own independent holiday (and therefore has no relationship to the earlier day's sacrifice). He proves this from the fact that just as the first seven days require their own sacrifices, song, blessing, and sleeping over in Yerushalayim,<sup>4</sup> so does the eighth day require its own sacrifices, song, blessing, and sleeping over in Yerushalayim. The Gemora assumes that the blessing Rabbi Yehudah refers to is Shehecheyanu, supporting Rabbi Yochanan. The Gemora deflects this by saying that it refers to Bircas HaMazon and Shemoneh Esrei. The Gemora says this is a more likely explanation, for if you should think it refers to Shehecheyanu, is there in

<sup>3</sup> Thirteen on the first day and one less every day. As the number is in any case steadily diminished, the additional omission of one or more cannot affect the remainder.

<sup>4</sup> The mitzvah of linah - remaining in Jerusalem for the night following the festival, mentioned in the case of Pesach is adduced to apply to all festivals.

<sup>5</sup> 'Your tents' is understood to refer to tents pitched outside of Jerusalem; but it cannot mean home, firstly because one might

fact a recitation of Shehecheyanu for seven days? – This is not a difficulty, as is one does not say the blessing today, he recites it tomorrow or any of the following days. The Gemora asks: How one can do so, as he still needs a cup of wine, which is not common on a day other than Yom Tov, and suggests that this supports Rav Nachman, who says that one can say Shehecheyanu even in the marketplace, even without a cup of wine, for if you would say a cup is required, is there a cup available every day? The Gemora deflects this by saying that the Baraisa means that one can say it, if he happens to have a cup of wine. (47a2 – 47b1)

But does Rabbi Yehudah maintain that the eighth day requires an overnight stay? But it was taught in a Baraisa: Rabbi Yehudah said: How do we know that the second Pesach does not require the spending of the night [in Jerusalem]? Because it is said, and you shall turn in the morning, and go to your tents;<sup>5</sup> and it is written, six days you shall eat matzah: that which is eaten six [days] requires the spending of the night [in Jerusalem], but that which is not eaten six [days] does not require the spending of the night [in Jerusalem]?<sup>6</sup> What does this exclude? Does it not also exclude the eighth day of Sukkos (which is a one-day holiday). The Gemora deflects this by saying that the verse only excludes the second Pesach, which is similar to the first Pesach. This is also reasonable, for it was taught in a Mishnah: *Bikkurim* – *the first fruit* require a sacrifice, a song, waving of the fruits, and staying overnight. Who is the one who says that waving is required? It is Rabbi

not travel on a Festival, and secondly because the pilgrimage olah-offering was yet to be offered. The phrase 'in the morning' teaches that the night was to be spent in Jerusalem, even after the pesach-sacrifice was consumed.

<sup>6</sup> I.e., only the pesach-offering which necessitates the eating of matzah six days (actually seven;), and prohibits chametz necessitates the spending of the night in Jerusalem; the first Pesach alone fulfills this condition, but not the second.



Yehudah, and yet he says that it requires staying overnight (indicating that only the second Pesach is excluded in the earlier Baraisa).

For it was taught in a Baraisa: Rabbi Yehudah said: [And the Kohen shall take the basket out of your hand] and place it down [before the Altar]. This refers to the mitzvah of waving. You say that it refers to waving, or perhaps it only means 'placing them down? As, however, it is written later: And you shall place it down, the mitzvah of placing them down is already indicated. What then is the meaning of the former phrase, "and place it down"? It can only be in reference to the mitzvah of waving. The Gemora deflects this support, saying that the Mishnah may be following Rabbi Eliezer ben Yaakov, for it was taught in a Baraisa: And the Kohen shall take the basket out of your hand. This indicates that the bikkurim requires waving; these are the words of Rabbi Eliezer ben Yaakov.

What is the reason of Rabbi Eliezer ben Yaakov? It is derived through a gezeirah shavah of *hand*, *hand* from shelamim. Here it is written: 'And the Kohen shall take the basket out of your hand', and there it is written: His own hands shall bring the fire offerings of Hashem. Just like here it is done by the Kohen, so too, a shelamim is waved by the Kohen. And just as by a shelamim, the owner waves it, so too, by the bikkurim, it is waved by the owner. How is this done? The Kohen would place his hand beneath the hands of the owner and wave it. (47b1 – 47b2)

The Gemora asks what the conclusion is about Shehecheyanu on the eighth day. Rav Nachman says that one recites the blessing of Shehecheyanu on the eighth day, while Rav Sheishes says that one does not recite the blessing of Shehecheyanu on the eighth day,

and the Gemora rules that one does recite the blessing of Shehecheyanu on the eighth day.

The Gemora cites a Baraisa supporting Rav Nachman. The Baraisa says that the eighth day is a separate holiday in six ways:

1. Payis – a new lottery is held for the sacrifices of the day, unrelated to which families of Kohanim brought the Sukkos sacrifices.
2. Zeman – a new Shehecheyanu is made, supporting Rav Nachman.
3. Regel – it is a separate holiday (i.e., one need not sit in the sukkah).
4. Korban – the sacrifices do not follow the pattern of the earlier days.
5. Shirah – a separate song is recited, different than the Sukkos one.
6. Berachah – a separate blessing (i.e., it is referred to differently in blessings and prayers). (47b2 – 48a1)

## INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

### *Shmini Atzeres*

The Gemora rules that on the eighth day of Sukkos in the exile, we sit in the sukkah, but don't make a blessing. The Shulchan Aruch (OH 668:1) rules like this. The poskim debate to what extent is one required – or even allowed – to use the sukkah on the eighth day. Although the Gemora says one must sit in the sukkah, there is a concern that this will look like adding on to the mitzvah. The Gra says that whatever requires a sukkah during Sukkos (eating and sleeping) must be done in the sukkah, and we are not concerned with an appearance of adding to the mitzvah, since people sometimes eat and sleep outside for their own enjoyment. The Darkai Moshe says that one may not

sleep in the sukkah, since this would look like adding on to the mitzvah. The Darkai Moshe implies that this is because people do not often sleep outside, but they do often eat outside. The Mordechai, citing the Ra'avya, gives another reason for the distinction. The fact that one doesn't say a blessing on eating a meal in the sukkah on the eighth day, even though he did so on Sukkos, is a clear indication that he is not sitting in the sukkah for the purpose of the mitzvah. According to this reason, any act which wouldn't require a blessing on Sukkos (sleeping, eating fruits, etc.) would not be permitted on the eighth day. The Mishna Berura (6) rules that one may eat such foods in the sukkah.

The Gemora concludes with the Baraisa which lists six ways in which Shmini Atzeres is its own holiday. The Rishonim differ on the explanation of two of these ways.

The Baraisa says it is its own regel – holiday. Rashi explains that this means that one doesn't sit in the sukkah. Tosfos (48a Regel) cites Rabbenu Tam who says that it refers to the requirement to stay overnight, and Rabbenu Chananel who says it refers to the fact that it stops mourning.

The Baraisa says it is different in blessing. Rashi says this can mean that it is referred to differently in davening or that the king would bless the people on Shmini Atzeres. Rabbenu Tam agrees with the first explanation, as this would align with the earlier Baraisa, which used blessing to refer to the different mention in davening.

## DAILY MASHAL

### *A Difficult Departure*

The Gemara concludes that the halacha regarding Shemini Atzeres is meisav yasvinan beruchei lo mevarchinan, we dwell in the Sukkah but we do not recite a blessing for the mitzvah of dwelling in the Sukkah. The Medrash states that the reason why we celebrate Shemini Atzeres is because HaShem declares, “you, the Jewish People have been with Me now for seven days. It is very difficult to have you part from Me. Please, stay with me another day.” We find that the word yeshiva in certain contexts means to tarry or to remain behind. Perhaps the Gemara is alluding to this idea that we tarry in the Sukkah because it is difficult for HaShem that we leave Him, but we do not recite a blessing, because HaShem has never left us.