



Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamot of

Moshe Raphael ben Yehoshua (Morris Stadtmauer) o”h
Tzvi Gershon ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for their neshamot and may their souls find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

The *Gemara* now returns to discuss the authorships mentioned in the *Baraisa*.

Yehoshua

The master had stated: Yehoshua authored the book of Yehoshua, and the last eight verses in the Torah, which describe Moshe’s death.

This *Baraisa* was taught according to the view that the authorship of the last eight verses in the Torah was Yehoshua, for it was taught in a *Baraisa*: [It is written:] And Moshe, the servant of Hashem, died there. Now is it possible that Moshe being dead could have written the words, ‘Moshe died there’? The truth is, however, that up to this point Moshe wrote, from this point Yehoshua wrote; these are the words of Rabbi Yehudah, or, according to others, of Rabbi Nechemiah. Rabbi Shimon to him: Can [we imagine the] Torah Scroll being short of one word, and is it not written: Take this Torah Scroll? No; what we must say is that up to this point the Holy One, Blessed be He, dictated and Moshe repeated and wrote, and from this point, the Holy One, Blessed be He, dictated and Moshe wrote with tears, as it says of another occasion: Then Baruch (Yirmiyah’s scribe) answered them: “He (Yirmiyah) pronounced all these words to me with his mouth, and I wrote them with ink on the scroll.

With whose view does the following (ruling) said by Rabbi Yehoshua bar Abba in the name of Rav Giddel, who said it in the name of Rav, follow? These eight verses in the Torah must be read by only one person. Let us say that this follows Rabbi Yehudah (that these verses were

written by a different author than the rest of the Torah) and not Rabbi Shimon (who maintains that they were written by Moshe, and accordingly, they should be no different than the rest of the Torah)?

The *Gemara* deflects this proof. Although Rabbi Shimon holds that these eight verses were written by Moshe, just like the rest of the Torah, they were written differently, and therefore are treated differently for Torah reading. (15a1 – 15a2)

The Book of Yehoshua

Yehoshua wrote his book. The *Gemara* asks: But it is written: And Yehoshua, son of Nun, servant of Hashem, died? The *Gemara* answers that Elazar finished that section. – but it is written: And Elazar son of Aharon died? - This was completed by Pinchas (Elazar’s son). (15a2)

Shmuel

Shmuel wrote his book. But it is written: And Shmuel died? – It was completed by the Gad the Seer and Nassan the prophet. (15a2)

King David: Ten Elders

David wrote the book of Tehillim together with ten elders.

The *Gemara* questions why Aisan Ha’ezrachi (who is quoted in Tehillim) is not listed, and Rav answers that he is Avraham (who is one of the ten listed). [The proof is that] it is written in the Psalms: Eisan the Ezrachite, and it is written elsewhere (referring to Avraham): Who has raised up righteousness from the East.

[The Baraisa above] reckons both Moshe and Heiman. But hasn't Rav said that Moshe is Heiman, [the proof being] that the name Heiman is found here [in the Psalms] and it is written elsewhere (referring to Moshe): In all my house he is faithful? — There were two people named Heiman. (15a2)

lyov

Moshe wrote the Torah, including the story of Bil'am, and the book of Iyov.

The *Gemara* says this *Baraisa* supports Rabbi Levi bar Lachma, for Rabbi Levi bar Lachma said: Iyov lived in the time of Moshe. He proves this from the use of the word *eifo* – *how* – in the book of Iyov, and also in the words of Moshe. [The proof is that] it is written here (in connection with Iyov): Oh, that my words were now [eifo] written, and it is written elsewhere (in connection with Moses): For hown now [eifo] shall it be known. - But on that ground I might say that he was contemporary with Yitzchak, in connection with whom it is written: Who now [eifo] is he that hunted game? Or I might say that he was contemporary with Yaakov, in connection with whom it is written: If so now [eifo] do this? Or with Yosef, in connection with whom it is written: Where [eifo] they are pasturing? — This cannot be maintained. [The proof that Iyov was contemporary with Moshe is that] it is written (in continuation of the above words of Iyov): Would that they were inscribed in a book, and it is Moshe who is called 'inscriber,' as it is written: And He chose the first part for himself, for there the portion of the 'one who inscribes' [mechokek] was hidden.

Rava said that Iyov was in the time of the spies. [The proof is that] it is written here (in connection with Iyov): There

¹ The *Gemara* explains that Moshe was referring to Iyov, who had a long life like a tree, and provided protection like a tree over the people of Canaan in his merit.

was a man in the land of Utz, Iyov was his name, and it is written elsewhere (in connection with the spies): Whether there are trees [etz] there. - Where is the parallel? In one place it is Utz, in the other Etz? — What Moshe said to Israel was this: [See] if that man is there whose years are as the years of a tree and who shelters his generation like a tree.¹

A certain scholar was sitting in front of Rabbi Shmuel bar Nachmeini, and said that Iyov never lived; he was never created, but was only a parable. Rabbi Shmuel bar Nachmeini said to him: The text says: There was a man in the land of Utz, Iyov was his name. - But, he retorted, if that is so, what of the verse: The poor man had nothing save one small sheep, which he had bought and nourished up etc. Did this sheep exist? Is that anything but a parable? So this too is a parable. - If so, said the other, why are his name and the name of his town mentioned?

Rabbi Yochanan and Rabbi Elazar say that Iyov was one of the Jews who returned from Babylonia to Israel after the destruction of the first Temple, and he studied Torah in Teveria.

The *Gemara* asks from a *Baraisa*: The days of Iyov's life were from the time the Jews entered Egypt until they left.

The *Gemara* deflects this *Baraisa* by saying that it is only indicating the length of Iyov's life, not the time of his life.

The *Gemara* attempts to disprove this from a *Baraisa* that says that there were seven prophets that prophesied to non-Jews: Bil'am and his father, Iyov and his four friends, Elifaz the Teimanite, Bildad the Shuchite, Tzofar the Na'amassite, and Elihu son of Barachel the Buzite. [This *Baraisa* indicates that Iyov was not Jewish.]



He replied: And according to you, it would follow that Elihu the son of Barachel was not a Jew, but it is written that he was from the family of Ram? - Evidently (the reason why he is included) is because he prophesied to the nations of the world. So too Iyov (is included because) he prophesied to the nations of the world. - But didn't all the prophets prophesy to the nations of the world? — Their prophecies were addressed primarily to the Jewish people, but these addressed themselves primarily to the nations of the world.

An objection was raised [from the following]: There was a certain pious man among the nations of the world named Iyov, but he [thought that he had] come into this world only to receive [here] his reward, and when the Holy One, Blessed be He, brought suffering upon him, he began to blaspheme and curse, so the Holy One, Blessed be He, doubled his reward in this world so as to expel him from the World to Come.

The *Gemara* concludes that the identification of Iyov is a dispute among *Tannaim*, as indicated in a different *Baraisa*.

This *Baraisa* records the following opinions on the identity of Iyov:

Rabbi Elazar — he lived in the times of the Judges, when all was *hevel - vain*, as indicated by the use of the word *hevel* in Iyov. What generation is it that is altogether vain? You must say, the generation where there is a 'judging of the judges'.

Rabbi Yehoshua ben Karchah — he lived in the times of Achashverosh, when beautiful women were sought throughout the world, as indicated by the statement that Iyov's daughters were the most beautiful in the world. - What was the generation in which beautiful women were sought out? You must say that this was the generation of

Achashverosh. - But perhaps he was in the time of David (in connection with whom) it is written: So they sought for a beautiful woman? — In the case of David [the search was only] in all the border of Israel, in the case of Achashverosh, in all the land.

Rabbi Nassan — in the times of the kingdom of Sheba, as Iyov's animals and workers were killed by soldiers from Sheba.

Sages — in the times of the Chaldeans, as Iyov's camels were killed by three divisions of Chaldean soldiers.

Some say — in the times of Yaakov, and he married his daughter Dina, as Iyov uses the term *nevalos - disgrace*, also used to describe the attack by Shechem on Dina.

All these *Tannaim* agree that Iyov was a Jew, except those who say [that he lived in the days of Yaakov]. [This must be so,] for if you suppose that [they regarded him as] from the nations of the world, [the question would arise,] after the death of Moshe, how could the Divine Presence rest upon an idolater, seeing that a master has said: Moshe prayed that the Divine Presence should not rest on idolaters, and God granted his request as it says: That we be separated, I and your people, from all the people that are upon the face of the earth.

Rabbi Yochanan said: The generation of Iyov was steeped in immorality. [The proof is that] it says here [in the book of Iyov]: Behold all of you have seen [chazisem] it; why then do you act in this false manner? And it is written elsewhere: Return, return, O perfect one, return, return that we may gaze [nechezeh,] at you. - But may not the reference be to prophecy, as in the words: The vision [chazon] of Isaiah son of Amotz? — If so, why does it say: Why then do you act in this false manner?

Rabbi Yochanan further said: What is the meaning of the words: And it came to pass in the days of the judging of

the judges? It was a generation which judged its judges.² If the judge said to a man, "Take the splinter from between your teeth,"³ he would retort, "Take the beam from between your eyes." If the judge said, "Your silver is dross," he would retort, "Your liquor is mixed with water."⁴

Rabbi Shmuel bar Nachmani said in the name of Rabbi Yonasan: Whoever says that the Malkas [queen] of Sheba was a woman is in error; the word malkas here means the kingdom of Sheba.

Now there was a day when the angels came to present themselves before Hashem, and Satan came also among them. And Hashem said to the Satan: From where are you coming? And Satan answered etc. - He addressed the Holy One, Blessed be He, thus: Master of the Universe, I have traversed the whole world and found none so faithful as your servant Avraham. For You did say to him: Arise, walk through the land to the length and the breadth of it, for to you I will give it, and even so, when he was unable to find any place in which to bury Sarah until he bought one for four hundred shekels of silver, he did not complain against Your ways.

Then Hashem said to the Satan: Have you considered my servant Iyov? For there is none like him in the earth etc. - Rabbi Yochanan said: Greater praise is accorded to Iyov than to Avraham. For of Avraham it is written: For now I know that you fear God, whereas of Iyov it is written: That man was perfect and upright and one that feared God and eschewed evil.

² This extra use of judgment indicates that the generation was one where the populace would judge their judges, since the judges' personal behavior was inconsistent with their judgments and admonishments.

³ Refrain from a minor infraction.

What is the meaning of 'eschewed evil'? — Rabbi Abba bar Shmuel said: Iyov was liberal with his money. Ordinarily, if a man owes half a perutah [to a workman], he spends it in a shop, but Iyov used to make a present of it [to the workman].

And then the Satan answered Hashem and said: Does Iyov fear Hashem for nothing? Have You not protected him, his household etc. What is the meaning of the words: You have blessed the work of his hands? — Rav Shmuel bar Rav Yitzchak said: Whoever took a perutah from Iyov was blessed.

What is implied by the words: His possessions are spread throughout the land? — Rabbi Yosi bar Chanina said: The cattle of Iyov broke through the general rule. Normally wolves kill sheep, but in the cattle of Iyov, the sheep killed the wolves.

But stretch out Your hand now and afflict all that he has, and see if he does not bless You to Your face. And Hashem said to the Satan: Behold all that he has is in your hand, only upon himself do not lay a hand etc. And it fell on a day when his sons and daughters were eating and drinking wine in the house of their brother, the firstborn, that there came a messenger to Iyov and said: The oxen were plowing etc. - What is meant by the words: The oxen were plowing and the she-asses were grazing beside them? — Rabbi Yochanan said: This indicates that the Holy One, Blessed be He, gave to Iyov a taste of the World to Come.

While he was yet speaking there came also another and said: The fire of God etc. While he was yet speaking there

⁴ If the judge would tell a person to remove the stolen stick from his teeth (*i.e., correct a transgression*), the person would tell the judge to remove the stolen beam from his eye (*i.e., correct an even larger transgression*). If the judge would tell a person that his coinage was counterfeit, the person would tell the judge that his wine was diluted.

came also another and said: The Chaldeans made three divisions and fell upon the camels and have taken them away etc. While he was yet speaking there came also another and said: Your sons and your daughters were eating and drinking wine in the house of their brother, the firstborn. And behold there came a great wind from the wilderness and smote the four corners of the house and it fell upon the young men etc. Then Iyov arose and tore his shirt, and plucked out [the hair of] his head etc. And he said: Naked I came out of my mother's womb and naked shall I return there; Hashem has given and Hashem has taken away; blessed be the name of Hashem. In all this, Iyov did not sin, nor ascribe caprice to God. Again there was a day when the angels came to present themselves etc. And Hashem said to the Satan: From where are you coming? And the Satan answered Hashem: From exploring the earth etc. - He said: Master of the Universe, I have traversed the whole earth, and have not found one like your servant Avraham. For You did say to him: Arise, walk through the land to the length and the breadth of it, for to you I will give it, and even so, when he was unable to find any place in which to bury Sarah, he did not complain against Your ways. (15a2 – 16a1)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

Read Individually

The *Gemara* states that the last eight verses of the Torah, due to their unique nature, are read by an individual. The Rishonim discuss what this statement means. Rav Meshulam (Tosfos 15a Shmona) says that while the rest of the Torah is read by two people – the *chazan* (our ba'al kria) and the person called up to the Torah – these verses must be read only by the person called up to the Torah. Rabbeinu Tam objects to this explanation, and explains that our contemporary practice of having someone else read (*besides the person who gets the aliyah*) was not followed in the times of the *Gemara*, so the *Gemara* could not have been referring to these verses as an exception.

Instead, Rabbeinu Tam says that these eight verses must be read in one *aliyah*, by one person, and not be split between two people. The Shulchan Aruch (OH 428:7) rules like Rabbeinu Tam. The Ri Migash says that these verses must be read by a different person than the verses that precede them, to show that these were written differently. The Rambam (Tefila 13:6) says that these verses may be read without a *minyan*, since they were read differently. The Rama (Darkei Moshe OH 428:4) quotes the Mordechai, who says that the individual stated here is an individual who is extraordinary in his Torah learning, and the Mishna Berura (669:1) cites this as a reason to try and give the Chasan Torah (*which reads the last verses*) to one who is well versed in Torah.

Reading the Torah

Tosfos (15a Shmona) discusses why we indeed have the custom of someone else reading the Torah, and not just the person who gets the *aliyah*. Indeed, in the times of Tosfos, it seems that both would read aloud. Although the Yerushalmi states that it is proper for the *chazan* to be present at the reading, to resemble the method of the Torah being given via an intermediary (Moshe), the Yerushalmi merely means that the *chazan* should stand near Torah, or perhaps quietly prompt the person who gets the *aliyah*. Rabbeinu Tam explains that later generations instituted that the *chazan* should read aloud with the person who is called up, to avoid embarrassing those who do not know how to read the Torah.

DAILY MASHAL

Written in Tears

Rabbi Shimon says that although Moshe wrote the last verses of the Torah, describing his death, he did so differently than the rest of the Torah. The Ritva cites a text that states that for the rest of the Torah, Hashem dictated, and Moshe wrote, while for these verses, Hashem dictated, and Moshe read in tears. According to this text, the eight verses were written differently since



tears were used in place of ink. However, our text states that for the rest of the Torah, Hashem dictated, and Moshe repeated and wrote, while for these verses, Hashem dictated, and Moshe wrote in tears. This text indicates that the only difference was that for the last eight verses, Moshe did not repeat the words, since they were sad for him, but only wrote them, while teary.

The Gr"a explains the *Gemara* differently. The word used for tears is "*dema*," which has the same root as "*dimu'a*" - a mixture. The Gr"a says that all the letters of the Torah are permutations of Hashem's name, and existed before the world did. The letters of the Torah take the form they do today in the revealed manifestation of the Torah, but they exist in other permutations as well. For example, before the world was created, the chapters describing creation existed in different permutations, which did not describe creation. When Hashem dictated the last verses of the Torah to Moshe, before they happened, Moshe wrote them in a different mixture of letters, as they were before the Torah was given.

Excellent advice for a darshan

Our Gemara reminds us that in the era of the Shofetim (Judges) the Jews were so corrupt that they answered the leaders who upbraided them: "Take the beam from between your eyes!" In other words, before you say "Take the splinter from between your teeth", admonishing us for a minor fault, correct your own defects which are like a thick beam compared to our peccadillos.

Rabbi Chayim of Volozhin zt"l explained that Yirmiyah gave darshanim good advice to prevent their audience from criticizing them: A darshan must include himself in his audience, as Yirmiah says: "Let us examine our ways and investigate" (Eichah 3:40). Nachkorah – "let us investigate" – may be divided into two words: nach korah – "the beam rests". By including himself with those

castigated, the darshan removes the beam from between his eyes and it "rests".