

2 Teves 5782
Dec. 6, 2021



Taanis Daf 24

Produced by Rabbi Avrohom Adler, Kollel Boker Beachwood

Daf Notes is currently being dedicated to the neshamah of

Tzvi Gershon Ben Yoel (Harvey Felsen) o”h

May the studying of the Daf Notes be a zechus for his neshamah and may his soul find peace in Gan Eden and be bound up in the Bond of life

Rabbi Yosi bar Avin was a student in the house of Rabbi Yossi of Yukras. After time he left him, and came to learn from Rav Ashi. One day he heard Rav Ashi quoting Shmuel saying that if one removed a fish from the sea on Shabbos, once a region on it the size of a coin dries up, he is liable for killing (even if it is still flailing). Rabbi Yosi questioned him: Why didn't you clarify that this is only if it was the skin between its fins that dried up (for it is only then that the fish will certainly die)? Rav Ashi said to him: And is master not of the opinion that this statement should be attributed to Rabbi Yosi bar Avin? Rabbi Yosi replied: I am he. Rav Ashi asked him: But didn't the master regularly attend the classes of Rabbi Yosi from Yukras? He said: Yes. What made the master leave him for me? He replied: A man who has no pity on his son and daughter, would he take pity upon me?!

What happened with his son? One day, Rabbi Yosi from Yukras hired workers in the field, but when evening came, he didn't bring them food to eat. The workers said to his son, "We are hungry." They were sitting under a fig tree. He said, "fig tree, fig tree, bring forth your fruit, so that my father's workers may eat." The tree produced, and they ate. In the meantime, his father arrived. He said to the workers, "Do not bear grievance against me, for the reason I delayed until evening was because I was involved in a mitzvah, and it was only now that I could come." The workers exclaimed, "May God satisfy you like your son satisfied us." He asked them, "from where (did my son get you fruit)?" They related, "such-and-such was the story." He said to him, "My son, just as you troubled Your Creator to trouble the tree to produce its fruit before its time, so too should that person be taken (from this world) before his time."

What happened with his daughter? He had a beautiful daughter. One day, he saw a man who made a hole in in the fence, and peered through it (to observe his daughter). Rabbi Yosi asked him, "What is this?" He said to him, "My master, if I cannot merit to marry her, may I at least merit to see her?" Rabbi Yosi said to her, "My daughter, you are causing people pain; return to dust, and let people not sin on your account."

He (Rabbi Yosi of Yukras) had a donkey, which he would rent out daily to people. In the evening (at the end of the rental), the renters would send back the donkey carrying the payment. If there was too much or too little payment, the donkey wouldn't go. One day, someone forgot a pair of sandals on the donkey, and it wouldn't go until they removed it. (23b3 – 34a1)

When the charity collectors saw Elazar ish Birta, they would hide from him, since he would give them everything he had. One day, he went to the market to buy a trousseau for his daughter. The charity collectors saw him and hid, but he ran after them, and forced them to tell him what they were collecting for. They told him, "To [marry off] an orphan boy to an orphan girl." He said to them, "By the Temple service! They take precedence before my daughter." He took all the money that he had and gave it to them. With his one remaining zuz, he bought some wheat which he placed in his granary. His wife came and said to her daughter, "What did your father bring home?" She said, "Whatever he brought home, he threw into the granary." She went to open the door of the granary and saw that the granary was so full of wheat that it was protruding through the hinges of the door, and the door could not open because of the wheat. His daughter went to the house of study and said to her father, "Come and

see what the One Who loves you has done for you.” Upon hearing this, he said to her, “By the Temple service! This shall be to you like consecrated property, and you should have no more share in it than any other poor person in Israel.”¹ (24a1 – 24a2)

Rabbi Yehudah Nesiah decreed a fast. He prayed, but no rain came. He said: See how much of a difference there is between Shmuel the Ramasi and Yehudah ben Gamliel (himself).² Woe to the generation which was left in such a state (with an inferior leader like him). Woe to him in whose days such a thing has happened. This pained him, and then it rained.

The Nasi's court decreed a fast, but did not inform Rabbi Yochanan and Rish Lakish. In the morning they were informed. Rish Lakish said to Rabbi Yochanan: We did not accept the fast yesterday evening. He answered him: We all drawn after them (i.e., we are included in the Nasi's proclamation, with no need for individual acceptance).

The Nasi's court decreed a fast, but no rain came. The youngest of them, Oshaya, taught a Baraisa: *If it should happen that it was hidden from the eyes of the congregation and done in error.* This can be compared to a bride who lives in the house of her father. So long as her eyes are beautiful her body needs no examination; should, however, should her eyes be weak then her entire body needs examination. [Similarly, if the nation is lacking, it is a function of the leaders' deficiencies.] The Nasi's servants came and wrapped a cloth around his neck, hurting him for his harsh words. The townspeople intervened, saying, “Leave him be, as he also speaks harshly to us. However, since he does everything for the sake of Heaven, we do not say anything and leave him be; you as well should leave him be.”

Rebbe decreed a fast, but rain didn't come. When Ilfa (or Rabbi Ilfai), went down before the ark in front of Rabbe, said *mashiv haruach – He who blows the wind*, the wind blew, and

when he said *morid hageshem – He who brings down the rain*, the rain fell. Rebbe asked him, “What good deeds have you done to merit such a response?” He answered, “I live in a poor town, which can't afford wine for kiddush and havdalah. I therefore troubled myself to provide wine for kiddush and havdalah, and discharge their obligation for them.”

Rav went to a place, and decreed a fast, but no rain fell. When the shliach tzibbur went down and said *mashiv haruach*, the wind blew, and when he said *morid hageshem*, the rain fell. Rav asked him, “What good deeds have you done to merit such a response?” He answered, “I teach small children Torah, without discriminating between children of the rich and children of the poor, and if someone cannot afford to pay, I do not take anything from him. Furthermore, I had a pond of fish, and when a child was not learning well, I would bribe him with the fish, arrange matters for him and appease him; this would enable him to come and study.”

Rav Nachman decreed a fast, and prayed, but no rain came. He said to himself that this humiliation was like taking him and throwing him from the wall to the ground. This pained Rav Nachman, and then rain fell.

Rabbah decreed a fast, and prayed, but no rain fell. They asked him: Why would rain fall as soon when Rav Yehudah would decree a fast? Rabbah exclaimed: What is there for us to do? Is it on account of Torah study? [This cannot be] as we learn more extensively than they did, as in the times of Rav Yehudah, they only studied *nezikin – damages* (and found the laws of impurity esoteric), while we are well-versed in all six Orders of the Mishnah. When Rav Yehudah reached the passage in [the Mishnah]: If a woman was preserving vegetables in a pot etc. or as some say the passage: If olives are preserved together with their leaves then the leaves are not susceptible to tumah, he exclaimed: I see here the need for the analyses of Rav and Shmuel, and yet we teach Uktzin in thirteen different schools (studying all the laws of

¹ Elazar ish Birta did not wish his daughter to derive any benefit from the results of a miracle.

² Shmuel was answered when he prayed for rain alone although it was not the rainy season.

impurity); nonetheless, when Rav Yehudah would take off his first shoe (as a sign of affliction) for a fast day, the rain would already fall, while we cry out the whole day, and there is no response. And if it is because of my deeds, then if someone knows of something that I am doing wrong, let him come and speak up, but what can the leaders of the generation do, as the generation itself is unworthy of being answered.

Rav Yehudah saw two people throwing bread to each other. He said: There must be bounty (if people treat bread this way). He focused his eyes on them, and there was therefore a famine. The Sages said to Rav Kahana, the son of Rav Nechunya, Rav Yehudah's assistant: you, master, who are constantly with him, cause him (Rav Yehudah) to go out to the door next to the marketplace (so that he shall see that the situation is desperate). He caused him to do so, and he went to the marketplace. He saw a group of people gathered, and he asked them: What is the meaning of this gathering? They said to him: They are standing in line to buy a container of dates that are being sold here. He concluded that there was a famine. He told his assistant: Take off my shoes (to join in the community's pain). As soon as he took off the first shoe, rain fell. As he was about to take off the second, Elyahu Hanavi came and told him: The Holy One, Blessed be He, has said: if he removes the other shoe, I will destroy the world.

Rav Mari, the son of Shmuel's daughter, said that he was on riverbank when Rav Yehudah took off his shoe, and he saw angels who looked like sailors fill boats with dust that then turned into flour. When everyone came to buy from these boats, Rav Yehudah told them not to, since they were from a miracle. The next day, boats full of wheat came from Parzina.

Rava went to Hagronia, and decreed a fast. When no rain came, he said to them: Pass the night, you all, in your fast. The next morning, he asked them: Did anyone see something in a dream? Let him come and say it. Rabbi Elazar from Hagronia said to them: To me in my dream I was caused to call out: Good greetings to the good teacher from the good Master, Who from His bounty dispenses good to His people.

Rava said: Evidently, it is an auspicious time for prayer, and he prayed, and rain fell.

Someone once was liable for lashes in Rava's court, because he had cohabited with a Cuthite woman. Rava administered the lashes and he died. When the king Shevor's palace heard about this, they wanted to torment Rava, but the king's mother, Ifra Hurmiz, said to her son, "Do not quarrel with the Jews, because whatever they request from their God, He grants them." He said to her, "What is it?" [She answered:] "They pray for rain, and it rains." He (rejecting this advice) said to her, "that is because it is during the rainy season (so the rain that falls is unrelated to their prayer)." "rather, let them pray for rain now, during the summer season, and let us see if any rain comes." Hurmiz sent a message to Rava, "Focus deeply in prayer to bring rain." He prayed, but no rain came. He said before Him, "Master of the Universe! God, we have heard with our ears, our fathers have recounted to us, the work which You wrought in their days, in days of old, but we have not seen it with our eyes." In response, there was so much rain that the gutters of Tzipori overflowed all the way to the Tigris river. Rava's father appeared to him in a dream, and said to him, "Is there anyone for whom it is appropriate to impose upon Heaven to such an extent? Change the place where you are sleeping". He did so, and the next morning he found his bed marked up by knives.

Rav Pappa decreed a fast, but rain didn't fall. He felt weak from the fast, so he ate a spoon of cereal, and prayed, but no rain fell. Rav Nachman bar Ushpazti, sarcastically told him that maybe if he would eat more cereal, the rain would come. Rav Pappa felt hurt, and then rain came. (24a2 – 24b3)

Rabbi Chanina ben Dosa was walking on the road, and it started raining. He said before God: Master of the Universe! The whole world is happy with this rain, but Chanina is in pain! The rain stopped. When he arrived home, he said before God: Master of the Universe! The whole world is in pain, and Chanina is happy. The rain began to fall again.

Rav Yosef said: Of what avail was the prayer of the Kohen Gadol [on Yom Kippur] against that of Rabbi Chanina ben Dosa? For we have learned: [The Kohen Gadol on Yom Kippur] prayed a short prayer in the outer room [of the Temple]. What did he pray? Ravin bar Adda and Rava bar Adda both quote Rav Yehudah saying that the Kohen Gadol's short prayer (before exiting the Inner Sanctuary was: May it be Your will, Hashem, our God, that this year should be rainy and hot. – Is then heat beneficial? Is it not rather something harmful? – Rather [the prayer reads thus]: If the year is to be a year of heat, let it also be a year of rain and of dew, and let the prayer of those journeying on the roads gain admission before You. Rav Acha the son of Rava cites Rav Yehudah saying that the prayer would conclude as follows: May the authority not leave the house of Yehudah, and that Your people Israel not need to rely on each other or others for their livelihood.

Rav Yehudah quotes Rav saying that each and every day a heavenly voice goes out and proclaims: The whole world is sustained because of Chanina, My son, while Chanina, My son, is satisfied with just a kav of carob from one shabbos eve to the following Shabbos eve. (24b3)

INSIGHTS TO THE DAF

DERIVING BENEFIT FROM A MIRACLE

The Gemora recorded an incident with Eliezer of Bartusa where a miracle occurred with his wheat at the time of his daughters wedding. The Gemora states that he donated this wheat to charity. Rashi explains that it is forbidden for one to derive benefit from a miracle. He cites the Gemora (20b) where it states regarding one who derives benefit from a miracle; it will be deducted from his merits.

Sefer Hazechus from the Chidushei Harim (Beshalach) offers another reason for this prohibition. It is written: *"Hashamayim shamayim laHashem v'ha'aretz nason livnei adam,"* – we are only permitted to use this world. Something that comes from a miracle and is not in the regular nature of

this world was not given to us and therefore it is prohibited to derive benefit from the miracle. (I don't understand this reason because the entire purpose of the miracle was to provide for us – how can the outcome of the miracle be considered as part of shamayim?) It seems evident from Rashi that it is not only a pious act but rather one is forbidden to do so. Mitzapeh Eisan cites Rashi later on the same daf (24b) that would seem to contradict this idea. Rashi states regarding the incident with Rav Mari and Rav Yehuda that he didn't want to derive benefit from the sand that miraculously turned into flour. Rashi says that it is preferable not to derive benefit from a miracle and not that it is forbidden.

Mitzapeh Eisan answers that there is a distinction between a private individual and the public. A private person like Eliezer of Bartusa is forbidden to derive benefit from a miracle; however, when it is relevant to the public, it is only a pious act for them not to derive benefit from the miracle but it is not forbidden. (See however Mitzapeh Eisan, Minachos (69b) where he would seem to indicate that there is never a prohibition against deriving benefit from a miracle.)

In the Teshuvos Daas Sofer (O" C 119), he asks on this concept from the lighting of the menorah in the Beis Hamikdash in the times of the Chashmanoim. The halacha is that a certain amount of oil is needed in each bowl; how can the lighting of the menorah be valid if some of the oil came through a miracle? (It would seem to me that the principle of mitzvos lav lehonos nitnu should apply here.) The Maharshak adds that there is a halacha derived from the passuk 'mashkeh Yisroel,' that something that is forbidden for consumption by a Yisroel is forbidden to be used for the Beis Hamikdash.

The Ben Ish Chai (Ki Savo) asks on this concept from Eliyahu who derived benefit from the flour and the oil by the episode with the ben Hatraphis, even though that occurred through a miracle. He answers that it was permitted in that situation since the extra oil and flour was not recognizable. Every time some oil and flour was taken, it was miraculously replenished; therefore there was no prohibition against deriving benefit from the miracle.



The miracle of the oil in the menorah can be explained in the same manner. Each bowl had oil in it that did not come about via the miracle. The miracle was that the oil did not disappear. Even as it was burning, the level of the oil stayed the same. In this type of scenario, it is permitted to derive benefit from the miracle. (An explanation identical to this is brought in the name of Reb Chaim Brisker.)

The Rama (682:1) rules that one who forgets al hanisim should recite the following tefillah: Harachaman ya'aseh lanu nisim – The merciful One should perform miracles for us. The Tevuos Shor asks that if we are not permitted to benefit from a miracle and it deducts from our merits, why are we praying for a miracle. One of the answers given is that we are permitted to pray for a miracle that will sanctify Hashem's name in the world. The merits received due to the Kiddush Hashem exceed the amount of merits that are deducted.

Many commentators ask from the fact that Klal Yisroel derived benefit from the manna, the well of Miriam and the Pillar of Clouds that traveled with them during their time in the Wilderness. The Chidah writes that this is what Klal Yisroel was asking when they initially saw the manna. They said "Man hu." The letters of the word 'man' is a 'mem' and a 'nun.' This stands for ma'aseh nisim. Klal Yisroel was asking if they were permitted to receive pleasure from the manna which is completely a miracle. He adds that the logic of deducting from their merits would not apply there because the manna came about in the merit of Moshe and not because of them. Sefer Ezer Miyahuda states that regarding a miracle which is done on behalf of Klal Yisroel that sanctifies Hashem's name; it would be permitted to derive benefit from the miracle.

DAILY MASHAL

The Merit Of Children's Teachers

by Rav Yehoshua Sklar

When Rav asked the *shaliach tzibbur* what his occupation was, he wanted to find out what merit the man possessed

that had brought the sorely-needed rain. The reply was that he taught young children and treated those from wealthy and from poor homes equally. He took no payment from those who could not afford it and he used his own resources to persuade children who were unwilling to learn, to do so.

Our teachers have taught us that every statement of *aggodoh* in the *gemora* is part of Torah and is intended to teach us lessons about living a Torah life. This wonderful story contains several far-reaching and novel teachings about education and about Torah study that are applicable to both the school and the home setting. Let's go into some detail about what the story teaches us.

It is a time of drought: No rain falls, no produce grows, and there's no bread. The people cry out to Heaven for their lives and Rav decrees a public fast. Jews raise their eyes heavenward for salvation but no rain falls. And lo! As soon as the *shaliach tzibbur* begins his prayer the wind blows and rain falls — an open miracle! Rav asks the *shaliach tzibbur* in what merit this happened and he replies simply, "I am a children's teacher." The *gemora* brings all the details of his reply to Rav. First, in teaching the children he makes no distinction between those who come from poor and those who come from rich families. All are treated the same way, with the same understanding and the same dedication. Even though the teacher's income comes from the wealthier parents, he is not concerned that his livelihood might suffer by his evenhanded treatment of all his students. Second, he takes no payment from those who cannot afford to pay. Third, if a child is unwilling to learn, he "bribes" him with gifts from his fish pools. He doesn't abandon him. He expends effort and ingenuity until the student comes by himself to learn.

In telling us all this, the *gemora* is addressing teachers, instructors, fathers and mothers. One must never panic at the prospect of a difficult student, who has no wish to learn, but should seek ways to "bribe" him. It doesn't have to be with fish. There are more spiritual types of bribes as well. A particular trait in which the student or child excels in might

be singled out. Every child has something in which he is outstanding. This can be used as a means of drawing him towards *gemora* study.

As an example, I'll mention what one educationally-aware and warm-hearted family managed to do for one of their children who didn't enjoy a particularly good reputation at his place of study. This special family found a way to imbue their child with enthusiasm. The child had a talent for music and singing. They told him that he would be the family's "musician" at *Seudah Shelishis* and the arrangement lasted a long time. Through this the child received respect and felt accomplished. It gave him a very positive self- image and today he is a distinguished *talmid chochom* and a prolific author of *seforim*.

Rabbosai! Let's give this a little attention and thought! Of relevance is an excerpt from a letter that the Chazon Ish wrote to the rosh yeshiva of a certain *yeshiva ketanoh*. "You have the youth . . . from the . . . yeshiva over here with you. He needs both material and spiritual support for, according to my knowledge, he cannot be left to depend on his father's livelihood and it is impossible to go into detail . . . it is imperative that the yeshiva immediately provide him with full maintenance . . . Care should be taken to see that one of the rabbonim becomes his friend and I would also ask that the . . . *sheyichyeh*, should take an interest in this."

What devoted and fatherly concern lies in these words! The boy is in need of every type of support and there is no one to help. It is vital that the yeshiva should immediately start providing him with meals. The Chazon Ish begs that a spiritual friend and mentor be found for him. His concern for the *talmid* encompasses every aspect of his well being, from beginning to end. This is the type of concern that we should show for the welfare of our dear ones.

The truth is that we have absolutely no way of evaluating the worth of a Jewish child's soul. In his commentary to *Sanhedrin* (91), the Maharsha provides some astounding insights into the power of the Jewish soul.

The *gemora* states, "Rav Yehuda said in Rav's name, 'Whoever withholds an halochoh from a *talmid* is like one who steals him away from his ancestors' inheritance, as it says, "Moshe commanded us Torah, *moroshoh*, an inheritance, for the community of Yaakov." It is the possession of all of Yisroel from the Six Days of Creation.' "

Two questions can be asked. First, what is the significance of the *gemora's* expression, "Whoever withholds," implying an unwillingness to teach the halochoh, rather than the simpler, "Whoever doesn't teach an halochoh"? Second, why is the Torah said to have been Yisroel's possession since Creation? The holy Torah was given at Sinai!

These questions are answered by the Maharsha, who writes that the *gemora* is speaking about a *talmid* who is hard of understanding, like Rabbi Preida's *talmid*, to whom Rabbi Preida would teach everything four hundred times until he knew it fluently. Not to teach such a student sufficiently is tantamount to depriving him of the halochoh. This leads the Maharsha to an awe-inspiring statement about the properties of the Jewish soul, in answer to the second question. "It means that according to their creation and their natures from the Six Days of Creation, all of Yisroel are ready to learn Torah."

The Maharsha tells us that *Klal Yisroel* were created with natures that ready them to learn Torah. They were prepared for this from the beginning of Creation. Anyone who denies this is stealing what has been his ancestral heritage since creation, when this was made a part of the Jewish soul. Once we know that it is the nature of a Jewish child to learn and understand — that the foundation is always present — we should try with all kinds of "bribery" to make each child love learning and imbue him with the ambition to attain ever higher levels of Torah and *yiras Shomayim*.

May we see the fulfillment of the *posuk's* words "and all your sons will be students of Hashem" (*Yeshayahu* 54:13)!